(UCP-JLL)
UCP Journal of Languages & Literature

Volume 1
Issue 2

Faculty of Languages & Literature

University of Central Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan

Advisory Board

International Members

- **Dr Rakesh Mohan Bhatt**
  Email: rbhatt@illinois.edu
  Associate Head, Director of Graduate Admissions, Professor
  Department of Linguistics, University of Illinois Urbana-Champaign USA

- **Dr James Hye Suk Yoon**
  Email: jyoon@illinois.edu
  Head, Professor
  Department of Linguistics, University of Illinois Urbana-Champaign, USA

- **Prof. Dr Maha Rached Sourani**
  Email: maha.sourani@ul.edu.lb
  Department of English Language and Literature, Faculty of Letters and Human Sciences, Lebanese University, Lebanon

- **Prof. Dr Shahab Yar Khan**
  Email: shahab.yar.khan@ff.unsa.ba
  Department of English Language and Literature, University in Sarajevo, Bosnia

- **Dr Sun He**
  Email: he.sun@nie.edu.sg
  Education Research Scientist, OER Centre for Research in Child Development
  Research Scientist, National Institute of Education - Office of Education Research

- **Dr Manvender Kaur Sarjit Singh**
  Email: manvender@uum.edu.my
  Associate Professor of Applied Linguistics, School of Languages, Civilization and Philosophy
  Universiti Utara Malaysia

- **Dr Zahid Javed**
  Email: choudhary@tu.edu.sa
  Professor, Department of Linguistics & Foreign Language, Taif University KSA

National Members

- **Dr Wasima Shehzad**
  Dean & Professor
  Department of English, Air University Islamabad
  Email: wasima@mail.au.edu.pk

- **Prof Dr Waseem Anwar**
  Director, International Centre for Pakistani Writing in English
  (ICPWE), Kinnaird College Lahore
  Email: Waseem.anwar@kinnaird.edu.pk

- **Dr Jamil Asghar Jami**
  Dean & Professor, Faculty of Languages, NUML, Islamabad
  Email: jasghar@numl.edu.pk

- **Dr Fatima Syed**
  Professor and Chair, Department of English, Forman Christian
  University Lahore
  Email: fatimasyeda@fccollege.edu.pk

- **Dr Muhammad Illyas Chisti**
  Associate Professor, School of Natural Sciences, NUST
  Email: illyas.chisti@sns.nust.edu.pk

- **Dr Uzma Anjum**
  Associate Professor, Department of English, Air University
  Islamabad
  Email: uzmaraja2000@gmail.com

- **Dr Shahid Imtiaz**
  Associate Professor, Department of English, Riphah International
  University Islamabad, Lahore Campus
  Email: Shahidimtiaz19@hotmail.com

Acknowledgment

Disclaimer

The UCP Journal of Languages and Literature serves as a platform for scholarly discourse and the dissemination of knowledge within the fields of languages and literature. The views and opinions expressed in the articles published within this journal are solely those of the respective authors. They do not necessarily reflect the views, perspectives, or positions of the Editorial Board or the staff of the University of Central Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan.

Every effort has been made to ensure the accuracy and reliability of the information presented in the articles. However, the Editorial Board and the University of Central Punjab make no representations or warranties regarding the completeness, accuracy, or suitability of the content. Readers are encouraged to exercise their judgment and discretion when interpreting and applying the information contained in these articles.

The UCP Journal of Languages and Literature is committed to upholding the highest standards of academic integrity and ethical publishing practices. Any concerns, questions, or requests for clarification related to the content published in this journal should be directed to the respective authors, who bear full responsibility for their work.

We appreciate your understanding of this disclaimer and hope that you find the content within this journal informative and thought-provoking.

Table of Contents

An Estimation of Test-Retest Reliability of the Verbal Section of Entrance Test for M.Phil at the University of Azad Jammu & Kashmir, Muzaffarabad

Nouman Hamid[1*], Sehrish Shafi[2]

Abstract

This study examines the consistency of test scores as a gauge of test takers' performance on the verbal section of two editions (administrations) of the MPhil entrance exam at the University of Azad Jammu & Kashmir. The objective was to find out the extent to which test takers performed similarly in the two administrations of the same test. For this purpose, the verbal section of University Graduate Aptitude Test (UGAT) was administered to thirty students twice with an interval of eighteen days. The results indicate that students' overall performance on the test was constant between the two administrations. However, on each of the five activities in the verbal portion of the test, students' performance was less consistent as compared to their performance in the overall test. The results have important implications for future research and pedagogy.

Keywords: Entrance exam, test-retest reliability, university graduate aptitude test, verbal section

Introduction

Reliability is one of the most important characteristics of test usefulness (Bachman & Palmer, 1996) because a) it contributes in establishing the validity of test scores and b) it indicates the extent to which various kinds of generalizations are justifiable (Miller, Linn, & Gronlund, 2009). Reliability or *Reproducibility* (Fulcher & Davidson, 2007) refers to the degree to which test scores or other assessment results are consistent from one measurement to another (Bachman & Palmer, 1996; Fulcher, 2010; Mackey & Gass, 2005; Miller, Linn, & Gronlund, 2009). In

[1] Assistant Professor, Department of English, University of Azad Jammu and Kashmir, Muzaffarabad

[2] Assistant Professor, Department of English, Mirpur University of Science and Technology, Mirpur

[*]Corresponding author's E-mail: noumanhamid@gmail.com

assessment, reliability refers to the consistency of scores, not of the instrument itself as the same instrument may produce different reliability indices depending on the test takers and the situation in which it is used. Understanding the variation in retesting is essential for a variety of reasons, including evaluating the reliability of measures, expectations of validity and prediction, and providing bounds and reasonable expectations within which test preparation may have an impact, among other situations in which tests are used for hiring decisions or for more in-depth research (Lee & Wai, 2023). Moreover, reliability is an essential but not sufficient condition for validity. It is possible that consistent results may not be measuring what they claim to measure but for a test to provide valid information about the performance that it measures, it is necessary that the test yields consistent scores (Miller, Linn, & Gronlund, 2009). Furthermore, reliability is assessed through correlation coefficient which ranges from -1 to +1. A correlation coefficient of +1 means a strong positive relationship between two sets of scores whereas -1 means strong negative relationship and 0 means no relationship (Dörnyei, 2007; Fulcher, 2010).

Reliability or consistency is of different types, including test-retest (consistency across time), equivalent forms (consistency across different forms of the same test), interrater and intra-rater (across raters), and internal consistency (across tasks that measure the same thing) (Mackey & Gass, 2005). Of these, the present study is restricted to the test-retest reliability. To estimate test-retest reliability, the same test is administered to the same group of individuals at two points in time with a considerable time interval between the two administrations. The scores are correlated and the resulting correlation coefficient provides a measure of stability which means how consistent the scores are over the given period of time. A high correlation coefficient means that the individuals with high scores on test 1 will tend to score high on test 2 and vice versa. An important consideration in establishing and interpreting test-retest reliability is the time interval between the two administrations. If time interval is short, the scores will exhibit higher consistency. On the other hand, the consistency will be lower in case of longer interval of time (Mackey & Gass, 2005; Miller, Linn, & Gronlund, 2009).

Although test-retest reliability provides important information about the stability of assessment scores across time, it is surprising to find that most standardized tests do not provide test-retest reliability coefficients. Brooks (2005) provides the test-retest reliability of *Bilingual Syntax Measure* (BSM) for a sample of test takers who took the English and

Spanish versions of the test two times with an interval of approximately two weeks. A correlation coefficient of 0.62 was found for the two administrations of the English version of the test, while a coefficient of 0.64 was reported for that of the Spanish version. Both correlation coefficients show less stability of scores across time.

Association of Classroom Teacher Testers (USA) publishes a test called *Combined English Language Skills Assessment in a Reading Context* (CELSA). It has two versions, that is, a paper-based version and a computer-based version. Test-retest reliability estimate was 0.93 for the paper-based version and 0.96 for computer-based version (Strong-Krause, 2005). However, the time interval between the two administrations of both versions of the test is not mentioned in the study.

Educational Testing Service (ETS) provides an estimate of test-retest reliability with equivalent forms for *Test of English as a Foreign* Language (TOEFL) based on the analysis of candidates repeating the test within 30 days from January 2007 to August 2007. Reliability estimate was 0.91 for the whole test, 0.78 for reading, 0.77 for listening, 0.84 for speaking, and 0.77 for writing (http://www.ets.org/Media/Tests/TOEFL/pdf/TOEFL_iBT_Reliability.pdf).

All the above studies report test-retest reliability estimates for language tests. No published research on test-retest reliability could be located for aptitude tests like *Graduate Record Examination* (GRE General) published by ETS or *Graduate Assessment Test* (GAT General) published by *National Testing Service, Pakistan* (NTS): A national testing agency mandated by *Higher Education Commission, Pakistan* (HEC) to conduct aptitude tests for admissions to post-graduate degree programs from 2005 to September 2014. After Lahore High Court's verdict that the universities are not under any obligation to be bound by the results of NTS in offering admissions at post-graduate levels, one of the alternatives given to the universities by the HEC was that universities could conduct their own tests. The University of Azad Jammu and Kashmir, Muzaffarabad (UAJK) conducted its first entrance test in September 2014. The test contained three parts, namely verbal section, quantitative section, and analytical reasoning. The researchers of the present study were part of the team that developed the verbal section. The purpose of this experimental study is to find out the extent to which the verbal section of the test produced consistent scores when administered twice to the same group of individuals with an interval of 18 days. This paper attempts to answer the following research questions.

a) How stable is test-takers' performance on the two administrations of the verbal section of the entrance test?

b) How stable is test-takers' performance on various tasks in the verbal section of the entrance test across time?

Methodology

Participants

Participants included 30 students who were in the final semester of MA English at the University of AJ&K. They were appropriate for this study as they were on the verge of graduating and many of them would opt for a test like this in order to get admission in M.Phil. Although the ideal sample for this study would have included participants from different disciplines, the participants with only English major were selected due to the reason that it was not possible to gather students from various departments at one place twice and conduct the test since academic departments in UAJK are located in different parts of District Muzaffarabad. There were 48 students in the final semester of MA English but only 30 volunteered to participate in the study. Out of these 30, there were 10 males and 20 females.

Development of the Test

A five-member committee was constituted by the competent authority to construct items for the verbal section. The committee in its first meeting decided on the number of items, types of tasks, and number of items to be included in each task. The committee mandated the researchers (us) to construct a pool of items for the verbal section. In the next meeting, the researchers presented the constructed test items before the committee. After a thorough discussion, the committee finalized the items that were to be included in the test. Due to the lack of time, the test was not piloted for item analysis.

Description of the Test

The verbal section of the entrance test consisted of 40 multiple choice items. Test-takers were given 50 minutes to respond to these 40 items. This section contained five sub-tasks. In what follows is the description of these tasks (See Appendix for the test.).

There were 11 items in the first task. Each item comprised a sentence with a blank space. Below each sentence, four options were given. For

each item, test-takers were required to choose the most appropriate option to fill in the blank. Task two consisted of 8 items. Each item consisted of a word followed by four synonyms. Students were to select the most appropriate synonym for the given word. For task three, test-takers were provided with 6 items. In each item, there was a pair of words followed by four pairs of words. For this task, students had to choose the pair that exhibited the closest terms of relationship as that of the given pair. Task four contained 7 items. Each item consisted of a word followed by four antonyms. Students were to select the most appropriate antonym for the given word. The final task included 8 items. In this task, students were given a reading passage followed by 8 multiple-choice questions/items based on that passage. Students were supposed to answer the questions based on their comprehension of the passage.

Procedures

The first administration of the test was held at room 5, block B, City Campus, UAJK, Muzaffarabad on Wednesday, December 03, 2014. The test was administered by one of our colleagues. Test-takers were requested to respond to the test items with the best of their knowledge and effort. They were also informed that their identities will be kept confidential and their scores will not be shared with anyone other than the researchers. They were told that they were required to take another test (they were not told that it will be the same test) two weeks later (i.e., December, 17). However, due to some unavoidable circumstances, the test was not conducted before Monday, December 22, 2014. The interval of eighteen days (originally fifteen days) between the two administrations was deemed appropriate by the researchers as it followed the suggestion of Miller, Linn, and Gronlund (2009) that the interval between the two administrations should not be too short or too long. The second test was administered at the same place by the same colleague. Both tests were scored by the researchers themselves with the help of an answer key. Each correct item was awarded one point and 0 was given to each incorrect response. Then, cumulative scores were given for each task by adding up the points given to each item belonging to that task. In the end, Scores on all tasks were added to give an overall score for the whole test (out of forty). The data were keyed in SPSS for analysis.

Results

Results of the two administrations of the verbal section of entrance test show that test-takers performed slightly better in test 2 as compared to

test 1 as the overall mean score for test 2 (21.93) is slightly higher than the mean score for test 1 (21.10). The same trend can be observed for four out of five tasks, that is, Fill in the blanks (FITB), word synonyms (WS), word antonyms (WA), and reading comprehension (RC). Table 1 presents the descriptive statistics for two test scores.

Table 1 *Descriptive Statistics*

	N	Range	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	SD	R	SEM
T_T1	30	21	10	31	21.10	4.84	0.63	2.94
T_T2	30	22	10	32	21.93	5.67	0.70	3.11
FITB_T1	30	8	3	11	6.70	1.84		
FITB_T2	30	8	3	11	6.93	2.03		
WS_T1	30	5	1	6	3.40	1.25		
WS_T2	30	6	0	6	3.87	1.33		
Anl_T1	30	6	0	6	3.10	1.32		
Anl_T2	30	5	1	6	2.83	1.34		
WA_T1	30	7	0	7	4.30	1.53		
WA_T2	30	7	0	7	4.37	1.97		
RC_T1	30	7	1	8	3.60	1.63		
RC_T2	30	5	2	7	3.93	1.57		

Table 1 clearly shows an increase in mean score from 6.70 to 6.93 for FIIB, from 3.40 to 3.87 for WS, from 4.30 to 4.37 for WA, and from 3.60 to 3.93 for RC. On the other hand, Analogy (Anl) is the only task on which test-takers' performance decreased from test 1 to test 2 (3.10 to 2.83). Similarly, there is also an increase in the standard deviation of scores for test 2 (5.67) as compared to the standard deviation of scores for test 1 (4.84), which means that test 2 scores show more variability as compared to test 1 scores. Furthermore, scores on four out of five tasks also exhibit this trend with WA showing the largest variability for test 2 scores. However, RC displays more variability for test 1 scores (1.63) as compared to test 2 scores (1.57). Internal consistency reliability coefficient (Chronbach's alpha) was found to be 0.63 for test 1 and 0.70 for test 2. As the Standard Error of Measurement (SEM) for test 1 is 2.94, it means that test-takers' true score range within one unit of SEM for test 1 would be 18.16-24.04. With an SEM of 3.11, the true score range within one unit of SEM for test 2 would be 18.82-25.04.

In order to establish the degree to which scores were consistent from one administration to the other, Pearson product-moment correlation coefficients were computed for the overall test scores as well as for the scores on five tasks. Table 2 presents a summary of the findings.

Table 2 *Test-retest Reliability*

	Test 1 + Test 2	Sig.
Total	0.80	.000
FITB	0.52	.003
WS	0.34	.063
Anl	0.59	.001
WA	0.54	.002
RC	0.67	.001

Table 2 displays a correlation coefficient of r (28) = 0.80, p = .000 for the overall test scores. For the sub-parts, the table shows significant correlation for four out of five tasks. For FITB, the correlation coefficient is r (28) = 0.52, p = .003, for Anl, it is r (28) = 0.59, p = .001, for WA, it is r (28) = 0.54, p = .002, and for RC, it is r (28) = 0.67, p = .001. For WS, the correlation, r (28) = 0.34, p = .063, is not significant as the significance value exceeds .05.

Discussion and Conclusion

The present study aimed at finding out the extent to which the verbal section of the entrance test for M.Phil at the UAJK produced consistent scores when administered twice to the same group of individuals with an interval of 18 days. For this, the study set out to find answers to the following research questions.

a) How stable is test-takers' performance on the two administrations of the verbal section of the entrance test?

b) How stable is test-takers' performance on various tasks in the verbal section of the entrance test across time?

For the first question, this study shows that students' performance was highly stable on the two administrations of the test as indicated by the correlation coefficient of 0.80 for the overall test scores. Measures of stability in the 0.80 range are commonly reported for standardized tests of aptitude and achievement over occasions within the same year (Miller, Linn, & Gronlund, 2009, p, 110). A glance at the mean scores for overall tests also reveals that there is not much difference in the performance of test-takers on the two tests. Moreover, as shown in table 1, both tests exhibit moderate internal consistency reliability coefficients (alpha = 0.63 for test 1 and alpha = 0.7 for test 2), which show that the scores on sub-parts of the test are also reliable as an alpha coefficient between 0.6

and 0.8 is considered acceptable for non-standardized tests (Morgan, Leech, Gloeckner, & Barrett, 2007; Subkoviak, 1988).

Although test-retest reliability coefficient for this experimental study is higher than that reported for BSM by Brooks (2005), it is much lower than that for TOEFL and CELSA. The reason may be that these standardized tests are constructed, piloted, edited, and revised by assessment experts, whereas the test for this study did not undergo these stages and also because this was the very first test of its kind that was developed at UAJK. Considering these facts, it can be safely concluded that the test-takers' performance was highly stable across the two administrations.

As far as the second research question is concerned, the data show that students' performance was not highly stable on any of the five tasks. Table 2 reveals that students' performance was moderately stable on only one task (i.e., RC). For FITB, Anl, and WA, their performance was somewhat stable but their performance on the WS part lacked stability. There could be many possible reasons for this lack of stability, including increased learning during the interval between the tests, anxiety, lack of motivation, mood, and the possibility of guessing --- to name just a few.

The results of the present study have important implications. For assessment practitioners, the study shows that the true performance of test-takers cannot be judged by the single administration of a test. It is very important to establish the extent to which learners' performance is consistent or improves over time. They should not make decisions regarding students' performance on the basis of a single test but rather on the basis of multiple administration of a test. Future studies can take participants from various disciplines as well as conduct detailed analysis of the factors that contribute in consistency or inconsistency in test-takers' performance across two administrations of the same test. Moreover, to better understand students' experiences and enhance the test, longitudinal studies, rewriting test components, and qualitative research may all be included in future research.

Reference

Bachman, L., & Palmer, A. (1996). *Language testing in practice: Designing and developing useful language tests.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Brooks, L. (2005). Bilingual syntax measure (BSM) I and II. In S. Stoynoff & C. Chapelle (Eds.), *ESOL tests and testing* (pp. 38-42). Alexandria, VA: TESOL.

Dörnyei, Z. (2007). *Research methods in applied linguistics: Quantitative, qualitative, and mixed methodologies*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Educational Testing Service. (2008). Reliability and comparability of TOEFL iBT scores. Retrieved from http://www.ets.org/Media/Tests/TOEFL/pdf/TOEFL_IBT_Reliability.pdf.

Fulcher, G. (2010). *Practical language testing*. London: Hodder Education.

Fulcher, G., & Davidson, F. (2007). *Language testing and assessment: An advanced resource Book*. New York: Routledge.

Mackey, A., & Gass, S. (2005). *Second language research: Methodology and design*. New York: Routledge.

Miller, M., Linn, R., & Gronlund, N. (2009). *Measurement and evaluation in teaching.* Upper Saddle River, NJ: Merrill, Prentice Hall.

Morgan, G., Leech, N., Gloeckner, G., & Barrett, K. (2007). *SPSS for introductory statistics:Use and interpretation.* London: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers.

Strong-Krause, D. (2005). Combined English language skills assessment in a reading context (CELSA). In S. Stoynoff & C. Chapelle (Eds.), *ESOL tests and testing* (pp. 57-58). Alexandria, VA: TESOL.

Subkoviak, M. (1988). A practitioner's guide to computation and interpretation of reliability indices for mastery tests. *Journal of Educational Measurement, 25,* 47-55.

Appendix
The University of Azad Jammu & Kashmir

Time Allowed: 50 minutes

Note: Cutting and/or over-writing will result in the loss of points.

Directions for questions 1 –11: In each sentence given below, there is a blank space. Below each sentence four options, marked (a), (b), (c) and (d) are given. Out of these, choose the most appropriate option to fill in the blank.

1 - Alexander Fleming, _____, received the Nobel Prize in 1945.
    a) who discovered Penicillin   b) which discovered Penicillin
    c) he discovered Penicillin   d) that discovered Penicillin

2 - In the ear, just above the cochlea, there are three small semi-circular canals _____ as an organ of balance.
    a) that function together   b) function together
    b) are functioning together   d) they function together

3 - _____ riding a bicycle is good leg exercise; it does not use up a lot of calories.
    a) as   b) although   c) because
    d) so that

4 - She turned off the tape recorder _____ she could study.
    a) now that   b) even if   c) so that
    d) in case

5 - Pearl Bock, who was the first American woman to win a Nobel Prize for Literature, _____ for her novel Good Health.
    a) who is best known   b) which is best known
    c) is best known   d) best known

6 - It was the impact of railroad _____ agriculture in the west.
    a) it expanded   b) expanded
    c) that it had expanded   d) that expanded

7 - _____ to the issuance of stamps, letters were marked 'paid' by pen & ink or hand stamps.

a) in accordance   b) before   c) due
                    d) prior

8 - Fredrick J Turner, _____, argued that the Frontier shaped a distinctive way of life.
a) a famous American historian who   b) a famous American historian
c) despite a famous American historian   d) he is a famous American historian

9 - Solar Beat Penetrates more deeply into water than _____.
a) it is penetrating into the soil   b) it does into soil
c) does it into soil   d) that it does into soil

10 - The more distant a star happens to be, _____ to us.
a) the dimmest it seems   b) the dimmer it seems
c) it seems dimmer   d) it seems dimmest

11 - The research conducted by the students was so _____ that every detail was included in their report.
a)   definite   b) complete   c) comprehensive
                    d) specific

Directions for questions 12 – 19: Select the word which is similar in meaning to the given word.

12 - NEPOTISM
a) Favoritism   b) Classicism
c) Nationalism   d) Socialism

13- PLAGIARISM
a) Theft of funds   b) Theft of ideas
c) Belief in God   d) Ethical theory

14- MENTOR
a) Guide   b) Genius
c) Philosopher   d) Stylist

15- FRANCHISE
a) Discount   b) License
c) Reason   d) Fashion

16- TENTATIVE
a) Prevalent   b) Experimental
c) Mocking   d) Provisional

17- ENSUE
a) Come afterward   b) Precede
c) Introduce   d) Praise

18- TURMOIL

a) Peace   b) Destruction
c) Order   d) Disturbance

19- MESMERIZE
     a) Remember   b) Delay
     c) Hypnotize   d) Analyze

Directions for question 20– 25: Select the pair of words that show the closest terms of relationship as that of the given pair.

20 – SECOND: MINUTE
a) Year: Month   b) Centimeter: Inch
c) Mile: Hour   d) Day: Week

21 – AUTHOR: WRITE
a) Mother: Annoy   b) Janitor: Clean
c) Banker: Preach   d) Firefighter: Study

22 – BROKEN: REPAIRED
a) Foreign: Strange   b) Unusual: Weird
c) Selfish: Generous   d) Nasty: Mean

23 – ZEBRA: ANIMAL
a) Green: Colour   b) Shape: Cube
c) Country: Brazil   d) Food: Dessert

24 – EVIL: MORALS
a) Special: Manners   b) Famous: Friends
c) Blind: Sight   d) Beautiful: Opinions

25 – RACIST: PREJUDICED
a) Clerk: Hungry   b) Nurse: Sick
c) Worker: Tired   d) Saint: Holy

Direction for questions 26 – 32: Select the word which is opposite in meaning to the given word.

26 - MAGNIFICENT
     a) Big   b) Small
     c) Unimpressive   d) Gigantic

27 - ARROGANT
     a) Snooty   b) Stupid
     c) Cunning   d) Humble

28 - FILTHY
     a) Clean   b) Nice
     c) Dirty   d) Pretty

29 - GLOOMY

a) Dark   b) Cheerful

c) Impressive   d) Ugly

30 - OPTIMIST

a) Naturalist   b) Realist

c) Pessimist   d) Activist

31 – ACCIDENTAL

a) Surprising   b) Sudden

c) Incidental   d) Deliberate

32 – PROFESSIONAL

a) National   b) Amateur

c) Mature   d) Traditional

Directions for question 33-40: Read the following passage carefully and answer the questions by referring to it.

PASSAGE

It is bad to have food stuck between your teeth for long periods of time. This is because food attracts germs, germs produce acid, and acid hurts your teeth and gums. Flossing helps to remove the food that gets stuck between your teeth. This explains why flossing helps to keep your mouth healthy, but some doctors say that flossing can be also good for your heart.

It may seem strange that something you do for your teeth can have any effect on your heart. Doctors have come up with a few ideas about how flossing works to keep your heart healthy. One idea is that the germs that hurt your teeth can leave the mouth and travel into your blood. Germs that get into the blood can then attack your heart. Another idea is based on the fact that when there are too many germs in your mouth, the body tries to fight against these germs. For some reason, the way the body fights these mouth germs may end up weakening the heart over time.

Not every doctor agrees about these ideas. Some doctors think that the link between good flossing habits and good heart health is only a coincidence. A coincidence is the occurrence of two or more events at one time apparently by mere chance. The incidence of these events is completely random, as they do not admit of any reliable cause and effect relationship between them. For example, every time I wash my car, it rains. This does not mean that when I wash my car, I somehow change the weather. This is only a coincidence. Likewise, some doctors think that people who have bad flossing habits just happen to also have heart problems, and people who have good flossing habits just happen to have healthy hearts.

The theory that flossing your teeth helps to keep your heart healthy might not be true. But every doctor agrees that flossing is a great way to keep your teeth healthy. So even if flossing does not help your heart, it is sure to help your teeth. This is enough of a reason for everyone to floss their teeth every day.

33 - Which of the following would be the best title for this passage?
a) Why Doctors Disagree about Flossing
b) How to Keep Your Teeth Healthy
c) Flossing Your Way to a Healthy Heart
d) Flossing by Coincidence

34 - Flossing effectively helps to keep your mouth healthy by preventing
a) germs from producing acid
b) food from entering your body
c) germs from entering into your blood
d) acid from contacting your teeth and gums

35 - In paragraph 2, the author introduces ideas about how flossing works to keep your heart health y. Exactly how many of these ideas does the author put forth in this paragraph?
a) 1   b) 2   c) 3   d) 4

36 - In paragraph 2, the author explains how having too many germs in your mouth can "end up weakening the heart." Using the passage as a guide, it can be understood that with respect to the actual way in which this occurs, doctors are
a) reluctant to hypothesize
b) confident in their estimations
c) extremely knowledgeable
d) uncertain but speculative

37 - In paragraph 3 the author writes, "Not every doctor agrees about these ideas." The author's purpose in writing this sentence is to
a) provide an example
b) introduce a new topic
c) change a previous statement
d) clarify an earlier assertion

38 - Using information in paragraph 3 as a guide, which of the following is the best example of a **coincidence**?

a) Jim wakes up with a sore throat. He eats a piece of bacon for breakfast. By noon, he feels much better. Jim decides that the bacon has cured his sore throat.
b) Laura remembers to brush her teeth every day, but she only remembers to floss once a week. She writes a note to herself, reminding herself to floss and sticks it to her bathroom mirror.
c) Mario is not very good at baseball. He practices playing every day. After a several months of practice, he is a much better baseball player.
d) Jai has a bad heart. Her doctor tells her to eat more vegetables and less junk food. After nearly a year of doing this, the doctor tells Jai that her heart is doing much better.

39 - Based on its use in the final paragraph, it can be inferred that **theory** belongs to which of the following word groups?
a) query, question, interrogation
b) assertion, declaration, affirmation
c) hypothesis, supposition, belief
d) idea, thought, notion

40 - Which of the following best states the main idea of the final paragraph?
a) Because doctors do not agree that flossing will help your heart, it is useless to floss.
b) It is a fact that flossing can help your heart as well as your teeth.
c) Even if flossing is only good for your teeth, you should still do it every day.
d) There is no good reason to believe that flossing will help your heart, but it is still a good idea to do it every day.

Postmodern Plurality in Terrell's *The Personal Librarian*

Natasha Khalil[1*], Nailah Riaz[2]

Abstract

The current research is motivated by the need to examine and bring to light the postmodern phenomena of Subversion of Metanarratives in Terrell's *The Personal Librarian*. This research study seeks to achieve insight into the overarching narratives in the story, and the process of disrupting those ideas to assert Mininarratives. To achieve this objective, the Theory of Mininarratives introduced by Jean Francois Lyotard in his book The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge (1979) is employed. Through an in-depth theoretical analysis, it is found that Terrell's text exhibits varying grand narratives such as Subjugation of women, Art for Art's sake as well as the metanarratives of Family and Relationship, which are overthrown by postmodern characters. This research study does not concern itself with other aspects such as Hyperreality, Identity Crisis, Historiographic metafiction and Diaspora. Future researchers can study these features in Terrell's novel. The research has significance as it expands on prior research that was carried out using postmodern views. Furthermore, it enhances the understanding of postmodern theory, and of the novel's status as a postmodern work of literature.

Keywords: Intertextuality, metanarratives, mininarratives, postmodern, The Personal Librarian.

Introduction

Heather Terrell's *The Person*al *Librarian*, co-written by Victoria Christopher Murray is mainly set in New York in the year 1905, when racism was rapidly growing in America. Segregation was not only implemented through law but had become part of the culture (Woodward, 2002). Originally known as Marie Benedict, Terrell came to know about Belle da Costa Greene while browsing the stacks of the Morgan Library in New York. Her story persisted in Terrell's mind, and she began to write

[1]Student, Riphah International University, Faisalabad

[2]Assistant Professor, The University of Faisalabad, Faisalabad

[*]Corresponding author's E-mail: natashakhalil001@gmail.com

this fictionalized account of the life of Belle with Murray, a Black author. The Only Woman in the Room, Carnegie's Maid, Her Hidden Genius, The Mystery of Mrs. Christie, and The Other Einstein, which is about Albert Einstein's wife, a fellow physicist, are Benedict's well-acclaimed historical novels. The books she published under the pen name Heather Terrell, include Brigid of Kildare, The Map Thief, and The Chrysalis. Christopher Murray, the coauthor of *The Personal Librarian*, has written more than thirty novels. Her well known writings include Lust, Envy, Stand Your Ground, Truth Be Told, Joy and Temptation.

The novel has a number of postmodern elements including the prominent feature of subversion of metanarratives. Both these concepts, in Terrell's novel, have not been analyzed as yet. This research is thus motivated by the need to examine and achieve insight into this postmodern phenomena in the text. Furthermore, postmodernism, specifically the deconstruction of metanarratives through establishment of mininarratives has not been given significant attention in the field of literary research. This study has been delimited to the analysis of the postmodern feature of Mininarratives present in the text. It does not concern itself with any other features such as Hyperreality, Intertextuality etc., in Terrell's novel.

Postmodern theory has been applied to a discernibly small number of novels. This research has significance as it adds to the existing research conducted from postmodern lenses. It unravels the obstruction of traditional beliefs and fixed accounts through formation of mini stories and different perspectives in local contexts. The research provides an understanding of how the 20th century society as it is depicted in the novel has progressed to an age beyond modernity, and how it shows respect for diversity and a celebration of differences instead of an admiration for the universal. Furthermore, it provides insight into the use of intertextuality and the functions it performs in the novel. The research also adds to the understanding of postmodern theory and of the novel as a postmodern piece of text.

Research Questions

This study attempts to answer the following questions:

1. In what ways do the mini, local narratives subvert the traditional, metanarratives in *The Personal Librarian*?

2. Which characters can be defined as being postmodern?

Literature Review

Focusing on the deconstruction of metanarratives, a study was done by Zaidi et al. (2018) who conducted a postmodernist and Marxist discursive analysis of capitalism in Doctorow's Makers. They used Lyotard's theory of mininarratives for postmodern analysis, and Van Dijk's model of Socio-cognitive approach for discursive investigation. The study revealed, from a postmodern perspective, that Consumerism and hypercapitalism, two practices of capitalism that ultimately lead to the collapse of the system, are discursively deconstructed in the novel. Different characters, themes, and the plot function to dismantle the grand narrative of capitalism and generate mininarratives. The researchers implied that from a postmodernist standpoint, it is no longer viable for capitalism's institutional framework to be exploited as a conduit for metanarratives of control, whether through consumerism, commercialism, entrepreneurship, or hypercapitalism.

In consonance with this study, Ashraf and Ahmad (1991) also conducted a postmodern study of Burnt Shadows with the aim to analyze the transformation of metanarratives by the creation of local narratives. For this purpose, they employed the theory of mininarratives introduced by Jean Francois Lyotard. The results of the study disclose that local stories in the novel challenge master "narratives such as colonization, imperialism, rationalism, history, culture, truth, stereotypes and science" (Ashraf & Ahmed, 1991). The discussion highlights the way characters defy and reject the stereotypical notions and the legitimizing narratives in Shamsie's literary piece.

Analogous to this study, Awan and Ahmed conducted a postmodern study of Mohammad Hanif's Our Lady of Alice Bhatti. They sought to examine the novel in light of Lyotard's theory of mininarratives and language games. Analysis revealed that different characters in the story are somehow linked to some language games that support particular metanarratives. A few characters, like Alice and Joseph Bhatti, dispute these stories, break the standards, and come up with new strategies to play a different game—a game of mininarratives. The text challenges narratives of patriarchy, science, identity, professionalism, and development in a truly postmodern perspective.

Theoretical Framework

Postmodernism has been defined varyingly by many postmodern theorists such as Hassan, Hutcheon, Forghani, Lyotard, Krijnen etc., as providing a single definition for postmodernism would be to violate its plural nature.

Postmodernism is defined by Hutcheon (2003) as "a contradictory phenomenon, one that uses and abuses, installs and then subverts, the very concepts it challenges' (p. 03). Contradictory to modernism which focuses on universal truths and realities, postmodernism stresses on disorder and the formation of subjective realities (Forghani, 2015). In accordance with Krijnen (2016), postmodernism is a discourse that "questions and subverts such notions as meaning, reference, knowledge, history, art, gender, and identity".

In its rejection of an all-inclusive reality and objective truth, postmodernism "questions centralized, totalized, hierarchized, closed systems" and disrupts them (Hutcheon, 2003, p. 41). Jean Francois Lyotard names these totalizing systems metanarratives. Hence, the current study gives a comprehensive account of the characteristic of postmodernism to challenge and disrupt totalizing systems, through elaboration of the Theory of Mininarratives introduced by Lyotard, in his book *The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge* (1979).

Lyotard's Theory of Postmodernism

In the formulation of his postmodern theory, Lyotard rejects Science as a metanarrative. Scientific knowledge, according to Lyotard (1984), "does not represent the totality of knowledge; it has always existed in addition to, and in competition and conflict with" narrative knowledge (p. 07). He also rejects other metanarratives such as Marxism, Enlightenment, Reductionism, etc. Jean Francois Lyotard (1984) describes postmodernism as having "incredulity towards metanarratives" (p. xxiv). Metanarratives include "metaphysical philosophy, philosophies of history, and any form of totalizing thought - be it Hegelianism, liberalism, Marxism, or positivism" (Best & Kellner, 1991, p.165). Metanarratives contain philosophies, theories, thoughts and worldviews which claim for unity and universality. A metanarrative "tries to give a totalizing, comprehensive account to various historical events, experiences, and social, cultural phenomena based upon the appeal to universal truth or universal values" (Branco, 2014, p. 07). According to Lyotard (1984), the metanarrative "has lost its credibility regardless of" its claims to universality, objectivity and totality (p. 37). Thus, he shows absolute rejection of the apparent objectivity of metanarratives. Furthermore, metanarratives are defined also as "the grand overarching stories that a culture tells itself, hiding several contradictions and inconsistencies inherent in the social order" (Mambrol, 2016). It follows that metanarratives are inherently cultural. Hence, they are equivalent to traditional narratives – the universalizing knowledge, beliefs and norms that motivate diverse social practices.

Against the concept of metanarratives, Lyotard introduces an idea of "plural, local, and *immanent petits recits*, i.e. little narratives in a given culture" (Pegelow, 1997, p. 04). A mininarrative rejects the grand schools of thought, and creates an account of its own. Mininarratives make "no claim to stability, reason, universality or truth" (Yousef, 2017, p. 36). In this way, Postmodernism is not concerned with "the expert's homology, but the inventor's paralogy" (Lyotard, 1984, p. xxv). Mininarratives characterize postmodernism, and assert differences. Furthermore, since metanarratives are universalizing, unifying and totalising, and mini narratives are the ones asserting differences, it follows that metanarratives are dominant in nature. Lyotard fervently supports innovation against complete inclusiveness. In his *Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge (1984),* he states: "The answer is: Let us wage a war on totality; let us be witnesses to the unpresentable; let us activate the differences and save the honor of the name" (p. 82). The subversion of metanarratives by mininarratives, a war against totality, is at the forefront of postmodernism, and therefore a prominent feature of postmodern literature.

Research Methodology

The Personal Librarian by Terrell and Murray is chosen as the object for the current study as the novel is replete with postmodern features. The type of research is qualitative; textual analysis will be conducted on the novel to fulfill the objectives of this research study. Nature of the study is analytical. Concerned text will be analyzed in light of Lyotard's theory of mininarratives. Particular parts of the novel will be evaluated, and conclusions will be drawn from the analysis. Since the study has a theoretical basis and will be conducted to obtain new information from the analysis of the novel, the type of research in terms of its purpose, is fundamental. The research takes a novel, namely *The Personal Librarian* as its research object. Hence, the data is of primary type.

Analysis and Discussion

The analysis first demonstrates the metanarratives found in the novel and delineates their disruption through mininarratives. It then focuses on the intertextual references in the text.

Subversion of Metanarratives through Mininarratives

The postmodern individual posits variation and nonconformity. He/she deviates from the organized and overarching principles and norms that are practiced in a society or culture. Belle da Costa Greene, the female protagonist of *The Personal Librarian*, rises as a postmodern force. She

lives in a society that advocates dominance for men, and subjugation for women. There is no space for women in the business world. This is evident when Belle, as the personal Librarian of J.P Morgan, visits auctions and art galleries to collect valuable books, manuscripts, and art pieces. She is faced with surprised reactions of men in her society. For instance, at a Massachusetts auction, the men wonder and gossip what business a woman has at an auction. The thought of a woman being in a professional space where she apparently shouldn't belong is confusing and disturbing to them. This demeaning attitude of men reflects evidently even in their ways of going about the business world. The Grolier club, being a highly reputable private club that houses moneyed bibliographies and books and promotes scholarships, is a place Belle admires greatly. Yet she is well aware that she can never take a look "behind the closed doors of her Romanesque town house" because as a woman, she would "never be admitted" (p. 2). This signals the reality of the 20th century society where subjugation of women worked as an overarching narrative that operated dominantly in the business circles. Terrell vividly expresses this hostility and deprecatory attitude of the novel's men when in a conversation with her mother, Belle says, "Mama, I will never blend in with my peers. Those men will always perceive me as different, as an outsider. Because I am a woman" (p. 119). The novel's protagonist is confronted with the unsettling attitude of men towards women. She resists this traditional metanarrative of subjugation by boldly asserting her position among her acquaintances. In the same instance as above, she states: "I've come to believe that the best path to success is by embracing my gender, Mama. Flaunting it even" (p. 119). Instead of surrendering to the so called 'objective' values of society that render women as inferior, Belle makes her gender an entity that only makes her strong, and constructively different. She advances from categorizing Morgan's possessions and organizing his cabinets to offering advice on purchases and going to meals, events, operas and dances at his request with both social elites and art professionals. Terrell's Belle, thus, creates a mininarrative of her own, one that advocates equality of opportunity.

Besides subjugation of women, another linked grand narrative that asserts itself is the notion of the Female gender as cultured and restrained. Women of the 20th century were supposed to act polite, and maintain submissive behavior. This notion positions itself firmly in Belle's character. Terrell makes Genevieve a constant reminder for Belle to be 'ladylike'. Her manners and conduct are conditioned to be moderate, and feminine. This belief is imposed on her in such a strong manner that she continuously tells herself to act like a lady. Even when her "stride is quick", it should be "acceptable for a lady" (p. 1). Although she has an outshining spirit, she

suppresses her boldness to fit in the conventional society. However, as she begins to work a challenging job, as a librarian, Belle realizes how "important it is to be bold" (p. 77). She comes to understand that if she keeps shy and polite appearances, she will never be able to fully act on her potentials, and be a part of the progressing world. She concludes that her mother's directions and the conventional idea of women mark a boundary to her potentials. To make her place in the world, she has to be audacious. Belle begins to wear daring dresses, and at a point in time, speaks without significant consideration, whatever comes to "mind at dinners, operas, and parties" (p. 158). She rejects the standards the society has set for her, and through her dressing style as well as her behavior, she deconstructs the metanarrative of female as a deferential and phlegmatic entity. She decides to "plunge headlong" into the art world which holds profound meanings for Terrell's characters (p. 77).

Characters like J. P Morgan, Bernard, and Belle understand the messages art conveys, and highly appreciate its beauty. J. P Morgan has been collecting artistic treasures for years. He wishes to create an art collection that is unmatched in importance among other European and American collections. For Bernard, his relationship with art is a "love affair" that happened, not immediately, but "in stages over time" (p. 156). As Bernard remarks, observing Renaissance paintings and drawings "transported me away from myself and my reality to a time and place where true genius was possible" (p. 156). Art turns into a means of escape, and creates a productive space for Bernard. It is in interpreting the allegorical meanings hidden in artworks, that he transcends temporal and spatial limitations. Terrell makes art a tool of seduction for Bernard and Belle. This is noticeable when Bernard talks about his love for Italian Renaissance artwork. "His talk of art mesmerizes me", Belle thinks (p. 156). Thus, art is used as an instrument by Bernard, intentionally or unintentionally, to charm and attract Belle. From a very young age, Belle has a talent for understanding and appreciating art. With Bernard, she finds a different perspective through which she can perceive the art world. For her, "art springs alive in the Italian town and hills" (p. 183). Following this, it is concluded that Art comes to have multiple connotations for the characters. The characters' response to art works to create a metanarrative. Art becomes the expression of emotions, and its appeal, a universalizing truth. Terrell's characters legitimize the notion that art, by nature, appeals to an individual's feelings. However, while art has keen connotations for most of the characters, Terrell makes Jack a character with a perspective different from the rest. J. P Morgen's son, Jack, becomes the owner of the Pierpont library after Morgan's death. He owns the acquisitions of his father, but "does not connect with the art in the same way that Mr. Morgan

did" (p. 244). Art becomes a mere means of profit for him. He stands for a belief that negates the one supported by the other three characters. He thinks of artistic pieces as objects and assets, not as works that have an influence on the psyche. Art holds no profound meanings for Jack, and it does not appeal much to his emotions. Jack, thus, subverts the belief that art has charm, and that it conveys a message to the senses. He creates a small, local narrative that supports the idea of art as a mere material asset, and a means for economic progress. His notion of art, resembles in no way, to Morgan's affection for art.

During her career as a librarian, Belle and her employer's relationship grows dynamically. Their relationship reaches a stage where it cannot be explained by the means of a single, universal definition. The nature of their "relationship vacillates" (p. 131). At times, they tend to be romantically interested in each other whereas on other occasions, their relationship appears to be paternal. When Morgan tells Belle to stay away from Bernard, at first, "he sounds paternal" but later, Belle wonders whether it is more "possessiveness than protection" (p. 170). Their connection is paternal and romantic at the same time, going against the traditional conception of relationship. They both play a multitude of roles for each other. Terrell makes this clear to the readers through Belle's following thought process.

> For him, I was the daughter and son he never had, the confidant he'd always sought, the business and art partner who'd boldly advocated for his goals, and the lover he'd dreamed about but held in abeyance. For me, he was the father I'd lost, the companion with whom I could discuss the day's minutiae, the business mentor who'd supported me beyond my wildest dreams, and the lover for whom I longed but could never have. (p. 240)

Their relationship refuses to conform to society's standards, and overthrows the metanarrative of single-nature relationship. Both the characters create a mininarrative that asserts difference, and advocates the multifaceted nature of a relationship.

In the novel, Racism is another traditional belief that appeals for universality. The so-called 'objective' ideology of racism made its way into Belle and her family's life so wildly that there remained no hope of equality between Whites and Blacks. This prejudice is described by Genevieve when she states, "there is only black and white—nothing in between—and they will always be separate, but never equal" (p. 23). Racism then becomes the reason Genevieve transforms her family's identity from Black to White. Belle also acknowledges the idea that a

colored girl would not have the opportunity that she, as a White girl, is able to have. It appears that Belle and Genevieve, two Black people, do not fight against the racial prejudice but somewhat acknowledge and embrace the Whites' discriminatory attitude by blending among the Whites, the superior race, so to say. However, this does not seem to be the case with Belle's father, Richard T. Greener. From the outset, Richard stands against Genevieve's decision to transform the family's identity. He gives an account of his hard work for the rights of Black people, and expresses extreme censure and condemnation of this choice when, in a heated debate, he says to Genevieve:

> You have made official our status as whites. After all the work I've done to advocate for the equal rights of black and colored people. After how hard I've argued in courts and in newspapers and journals and on stages, that all citizens should be treated the same—whether they are black, white, or colored. That we should not be defined by how many drops of African blood run in our veins, but by our character and our deeds. That we should not be ashamed of our heritage and we all, blacks and colored alike, should unify in our fight against prejudice. Your act goes against everything I stand for and everything I've worked for—. (p. 22)

He condemns Genevieve's decision to such an extent that it becomes the reason for their separation. They get divorced and Richard continues to fight for Black people's rights. Being a Black person and identifying as one, Richard strives for the equality of Blacks and Whites. He publishes an essay called 'The White Problem' in which he calls Racism a 'problem' Whites created. Richard, thus, challenges and refutes the universalising ideology of Racism which has been passed down from generations to generations, and continues to affect Black people around the world. He creates a mininarrative in the story by striving for Black people's rights, and by being proud of his identity.

The label of Black, however, is not the only mark Richard and his family were identified by. They are also Fleets. As Fleets, they have to abide by certain rules that have been traditionally imposed on them. "To be a Fleet was to be…hardworking (the women were all teachers and the men, all engineers)" (p.14). All the fleet women, as informed by Terrell, adopted the profession of teaching. As demonstrated initially, Belle deconstructs this overarching notion, and overthrows a significant part of being a Fleet. Furthermore, Terrell also tells the readers that "Fleets were understated in dress and presentation" (p. 14). Genevieve adheres to this norm, and advises Belle to wear minimal dresses and be 'ladylike'. Belle, on the other

hand, decides that being moderate in her dresses and constrained in her speech is not the way to success. She wears dresses that stand out and boldly flirts with her acquaintances. Thus, she creates another mininarrative when it comes to the Fleet tradition. Fleets are also defined by their connection "to the community". Genevieve, however, cuts this very connection apart when she leaves DC to live in New York. The transition from Black to White, and the pretence of belonging to a Portuguese descent further confirm this break from her people. Genevieve, with her family visits DC only when her mother dies. Other than this, the family completely disconnects itself to the Fleets, thus breaking another narrative that constitutes the identity of Fleets. Genevieve and Belle, hence, assert difference and pluralism by not adhering to the Fleets' standards.

Conclusion

From the above discussion, it is concluded that certain characters in Terrell's novel perpetuate different metanarratives while other characters rebel against those legitimizing beliefs, and overthrow them. As a result, they create mininarratives that assert pluralism, and advocate different standpoints, creating multiplicity in the novel's context. The analysis has brought forth the metanarrative of subjugation of women, that of Teaching as the only safe career for women and the view of women as ladylike and submissive which are all closely related to each other. These universalizing beliefs are subverted by Belle who becomes a bold example of women empowerment. Other traditional narratives that are deconstructed by various characters are Art for Art's sake, the metanarrative of family, of relationships and of marriage as well as the overarching notion of Racism and that of Fleets. It becomes clear that Belle is the most powerful postmodern force as she subverts many legitimizing, traditional narratives throughout the course of the story. Other characters like Morgan, Bernard, Genevieve, Jack and Richard also work to create mininarratives. However, their status as purely postmodern individuals is ambivalent since some of them also perpetuate certain metanarratives.

References

Best, S., & Kellner, D. (1991). *Postmodern theory: Critical interrogations*. Bloomsbury Publishing.

Branco, L. A. R. (2014). Jean-François Lyotard: a response to Jean-François Lyotard's view of postmodernism and the denial of the metanarratives.

Forghani, N., Keshtiaray, N., & Yousefy, A. (2015). A Critical Examination of Postmodernism Based on Religious and Moral Values Education. International Education Studies, 8(9), 98-106.

Hutcheon, L. (2003). A poetics of postmodernism: History, theory, fiction. Routledge.

Krijnen, J. (2016). *Holocaust impiety in Jewish American literature: Memory, identity,(post-) postmodernism*. Brill.

Lyotard, J.-F. (1984). The postmodern condition. Manchester University Press.

Mambrol, N. (2016, April 3). *The postmodern as "the incredulity towards metanarratives."* Literary Theory and Criticism. Retrieved February 18, 2023, from https://literariness.org/2016/04/03/the-postmodern-as-the-incredulity-towards-metanarratives/amp/

Pegelow, T. (1997). 'Feminism'and'Postmodernism': Are There Some Things at Stake in Lyotardian Thought for Feminist Theorizations?.

Woodward, C. V., & McFeely, W. S. (2002). The strange career of Jim Crow. Oxford University Press, USA.

Yousef, T. (2017). Modernism, postmodernism, and metamodernism: A critique. *International Journal of Language and Literature*, *5*(1), 33-43.

Abdul Ghani Khan's Pushto Poetry: Evaluation of Themes and Implications for Cross-Linguistic Literary Studies

Hasnain Khalid[1], Azeem Alphonce[2*], Muhammad Aslam[3]

Abstract

Abdul Ghani Khan is a revered poet of Pashto, but he is widely unknown to both Pashto and non-Pashto readers in Pakistan. This study is an attempt to introduce Ghani Khan as a poet to Pashto and non-Pashto readers both nationally and internationally. For presenting Ghani Khan's themes and unique style, descriptive qualitative approach was adopted. Five poems were selected purposively from his English translated collection "The Pilgrim of Beauty" and were analyzed using Braun and Clarke's six phases of thematic analysis. The phases included familiarizing with the data, code generation, identifying initial themes, and refining the initial themes, as well as defining the final themes. As a result, 12 "latent themes" were identified and discussed which included love and beauty as blessings, mortality/beauty and immortality/love, love: affliction vs remedy, big questions: absolute truth, sacrifice, escapism, misery, honor, past-glory, rejuvenation, self-realization, and Panther. The study ends with a storyline that was developed to integrate the themes and stylistic individuality of Ghani Khan. The study has implications for the cross-cultural study of literary genres and for applications in Literature classrooms in Pakistani universities.

Keywords: Ghani Khan, Reflexivity in Poetry, Latent Themes, Braun & Clarke's Thematic Analysis, Literary Genre Analysis

Introduction

Ghani is a unique poet of his time and could be considered more modern than the modern poets were (Awan et al., 2014). Awan et al. (2014) argue that he trod very differently from the conventions enshrining his poetry in the traits of freedom of thought and ideological defiance, giving him a

[1] Research Student, Department of English, Forman Christian College (A chartered University) Lahore.
[2] Assistant Professor, Department of English, Forman Christian College (A Chartered University) Lahore.
[3] Assistant Professor, Department of ELT & Linguistics, IER, University of the Punjab, Lahore.
*Corresponding author's E-mail: azeemalphonce@fccollege.edu.pk

distinctive position among many modern and romantic poets. However, Ghani's poetry is an umbrella, covering multiple facets of life, encompassing the domains of realism, romanticism, rationalism, mysticism, materialism, nature, ignorance, and exploitation of ordinary men at the hands of local elites (*khans*) and the half-educated preachers (*mullahs*) (Ahmed et al., 2022).

Ghani questioned all kinds of authoritarian ideas and had a sophisticated philosophical thinking which earned him a unique position in poetry. His exquisite poetic style that was full of mystical beads made him a commendable Pashto poet (Ahmed et al., 2022). Ghani's poetry was also compiled in a book titled "Latoon" meaning "Investigation". Apart from this, Ghani was also a painter and sculptor and had written a book on his people namely "The Pathans: A Sketch" (Safa & Sahand, 2022).

In addition, Ghani's work has been subjected to investigation by scholars. Hafeez and Seemab (2019) explored two of Khan's poems 'Saaz' and 'Rishta' studying his poetic language and philosophy using metaphors to derive abstract meaning and conceptualization of life. Similarly, Shah et al. (2021) also compared Ghani's poetry with that of Coleridge, investigating the poems 'Zama Mahal' and 'Kubla Khan' respectively, where the researchers focused on intertextuality exploring their convergence and divergence in thoughts, themes, and linguistic styles. Likewise, exploring the abundance of Ghani's poetry, Iqbal et al. (2022) stepped into the environmental aspect of his poetry to identify his interaction with nature focusing on the notion of eco-centrism, ecological consciousness, and symbiotic inter-relatedness. 'The Pathans' was studied by Ali et al. (2022) stylistically focusing on Ghani's use of the figures of speech including simile, metaphor, anaphora, satire, personification, juxtaposition, hyperbole, symbol, alliteration, and oxymoron, as well as his unique style in employing the literary devices to portray the norms, values, and cultures of Pashtun tribes.

The purpose of this study is to explore the abundance of Ghani's poetry from the perspective of thematic analysis and to sensitize the importance of introducing the cross-linguistic and cross-cultural study of poetry at the undergraduate level in Pakistani universities. Likewise, this study adds to the existing literature available on the poetry of Ghani. Essentially, Ghani is a widely respected Pashto poet in the ranks of Pashto speakers who are exposed to his extensive poetry, but his poetry is not dealt with substantially in research studies, which for the most part leaves him alien to academics and common people who could otherwise have benefited from his thoughts. This study also introduces non-Pashto speakers in

Pakistan to Pashto literature so that local poets and writers may be acknowledged and appreciated. Besides, the study aims to familiarize the audience with the importance of employing social construction of meaning in poetry developing both the historical perspective and prevailing understanding of the national literature written in local languages.

Pakistani literature in the local languages is unexplored due to linguistic barriers, so a small effort was made to make available the local literature to both national and international audiences. The findings of this study suggest ways to expose the stereotypes regarding Ghani as only a Pashtun nationalist poet or anti-religious preacher. His poetry can be related cross-culturally and cross-linguistically, to present a philosophical understanding of God. Hence, this paper made a concerted effort to introduce Khan's poetry with both Pashtun and non-Pashtun speakers in the prevalent English language.

Research Questions

1. What is the perception of love in Ghani Khan's poetry?

2. How does Ghani Khan encounter the irrational preaching in his poetry?

3. What is Ghani Khan's message to the youth perplexed by cultural contradictions?

Literature Review

The following review of literature provides a theoretical context for the research questions of this study and the framework for the interpretation of the expected answers to these research questions.

The Notion of Love in Poetry

The word love means to desire, precisely, desire of the beloved (Stallworthy, 1986). Poetry has a strong tradition of talking about love that ranges from the love for a person, nature, and God (Stallworthy, 1986). Further, the notion of love that is depicted in poetry has an intensity in its expression because a poet can appropriate words to their situation about things either seen directly or through his heart and constitute what is called the language of love (Stallworthy, 1986).

Interaction with Religious Preachers in Poetry

An inherent tendency exists in a man to be religious, no matter how profane one expresses himself, a man has an unconscious struggle to find uniformity with his religious self in his mind (Panecka, 2019). Poetry extends a unique platform to the expression of religion and poets express themselves best in conjunction with their religious beliefs. However, poetry should not be mistaken with theology as poets merely strive to divulge the realities of life experienced by humans along religious or mythical lines (Panecka, 2019). In addition, poets usually invoke the services of religious preachers in understanding the true religion and their role in rectifying society of its moral corruption.

Address to the Youth Entrenched in Cultural Bleakness

Poets consider it a perpetual duty to address the youth in poetry. The aim is to guide the youth as they represent the future of nations (Ali et al., 2018). Allama Iqbal has written poems for children such as "Poems for Children" to instill self-realization in the Muslim youth and considers them the symbol of change. The youth will be able to relieve the Muslims of misery as he has described the Muslims of the sub-continent as encaged birds (Ali et al., 2018). Ali et al. (2018) argue that Iqbal has encouraged the youth calling them nightingales that will lead Muslims through the dark nights if they persevere and work hard.

Poetry reflects the social patterns in a society celebrating the values highlighting the downtrodden and the political, economic, and social landscape (Mushonga, 2018). Acknowledging these opens new arenas for thinking as poetry provides a formidable medium where poets can express their raw, pristine, and deep thoughts about society (Mushonga, 2018). Mushonga (2018) argues that the succinct understanding of a society can be observed by perceiving its socio-political tendencies, socio-economic conditions, and sociocultural outlook.

Safa, and Sahand (2022). probed philosophical thoughts unpacking philosophical elements in Ghani Khan's poetry. The study reveals that the presence of philosophical views does not make him a philosopher as philosophers hold on to rationalism, logic, and reason while poets express their work based on imagination, feelings, and fantasy, unlike philosophers, Ghani believes that everything in the universe rests on God (Safa & Sahand, 2022). This can be a point of inquiry into Ghani Khan's interest in engaging with the religious preacher in his poetry asking about

God. This study only focuses on the philosophical aspect of Ghani Khan, making it restricted to the audience interested in philosophical literature or poetry.

Nonetheless, Ahmed et al. (2022) have probed mystical elements in the poetry of Ghani discovering various themes of mysticism that Ghani explored in his poetry including nature, the existence of God, life and death, divine and human love as well as beauty. Multiple excerpts from Ghani's work were examined and the study concluded that Ghani was not a mystic or Sufi himself, but his poetry did contain unique and rich thoughts on mysticism (Ahmed et al., 2022). Further, Ghani's approach toward mystic thoughts in his poetry was different from the traditional Pashto poets who were either Sufis or had merely dealt with Sufism in their poetry (Ahmed et al., 2022). Hence, this study is narrowly focused on the mystical aspects of Ghani's poetry, and can attract only readers having an interest in mystical literature.

Furthermore, the modernist features of Ghani's poetry were examined for gathering instances of such features. The features included the use of allusions, free verse, themes of cultural pessimism and mistrust in orthodox mindset, usage of sensual words, imagistic setting, and symbolism (Awan et al., 2014). However, the researchers believe that more work needs to be carried out to comprehend Khan's poetry in its entirety and present it to local and foreign audiences because looking at Khan's poetry from one theoretical perspective only limits the scope of his poetry.

Khan et al. (2020) conducted a study using the oriental approach to counter the notion that prioritizes Western literature written in English and renders all other literature from the rest of the world as backward (Khan et al., 2020). Keats and Ghani's poetry was compared to reveal common themes in their poetry as both the poets had a commonality in themes such as nature, beauty, love, and immortality (Khan et al., 2020). Essentially, Keats was a romantic poet and Ghani also had elements of romanticism in his work, although he didn't live in the same era in which Keats lived, i.e. The Romantic Age (Khan et al., 2020). Therefore, the researchers suggest that further study should be conducted to explore romanticism in Ghani's poetry.

This selected review of past studies indicates that a limited work has been done on a thematic analysis of Ghani's poetry. The previous studies either focused on a specific theory such as the modernistic approach and counter-oriental approach or touched upon the mystical and philosophical aspects of his poetry.

Methodology

A descriptive qualitative method was employed for this study. The data was collected from the English translated collection called "The Pilgrim of Beauty", consisting of 141 Pashto poems (Sahibzada, 2014). All the poems were consulted thoroughly before selecting the five poems that were consistent with the research questions of the current study. The five selected poems were: "Love and Beauty", "Love", "Come and Tell Me Pious Priest ", "Oh Young Man", and "Go My Child! Proceed Apace". (For the Pushto version of these poems, see Appendix A)

Method of Data Analysis

Braun and Clarke's (2022) reflexive thematic analysis was conducted using their six phases of theme development. The poems were thoroughly read by the researchers to familiarize themselves with the data and then codes were generated. Then the codes were transformed into initial themes, which were later refined after careful examination; the themes were then defined; and finally, a storyline was developed for all the twelve themes that emerged during probing of the selected poems.

Reflexive Thematic Analysis (RTA)

Reflexive thematic analysis (RTA) refers to the approach that puts stress on the subjective nature of coding data and analysis due to the active involvement of the researcher in coding and formation of themes, at the same time giving priority to the qualities of "Big Q" paradigm (Braun & Clarke, 2022). Further, Braun and Clarke (2022) argue that Thematic Analysis (TA) and qualitative analysis extend their premises to the social construction of meaning via social processes leaving behind the experiential phenomena. The constructionist approaches to language are focused in probing the rhetorical meanings and consequences of certain patterns of meaning and linguistic practices. Language is viewed as active and metaphorical, producing meaning rather than just reflecting it and language is not seen as a simple conduit for accessing information in constructionist TA (Braun & Clarke, 2022).

Mainly the focus is on the social construction of reality and the meaning frameworks or discourses that surround and form the phenomena of interest, as well as their ramifications (Braun & Clarke, 2022). 'RTA' has theoretical flexibility, which is misinterpreted as its theoretical neutrality. In fact, like other types of thematic analysis, RTA shares numerous

assumptions based on theory about the creation of knowledge, which are related to qualitative paradigms (Braun & Clarke, 2022). Following this thematic analysis, the researchers used the deductive approach. The researchers constantly contributed to their own philosophical and meta-theoretical beliefs during the analysis.

Phases of Thematic Analysis (TA)

Braun and Clarke's (2006) thematic analysis was done in the following six phases: familiarizing with the data: generating initial codes: coding as an essential part of the analysis, as data had to be organized into meaningful sections and this process assists in identifying an aspect of the data (semantic or latent content). To an extent, codes were bound to whether data was theory-driven(deductive) or data-driven(inductive). Deductive analysis was approached keeping in mind specific questions; searching for themes: here codes were analyzed, to form a broader theme considering the combination of different codes; and reviewing themes.

The themes were reviewed and refined at two levels: reviewing at coded data extracts level that involved reading extracts accumulated for each theme to observe coherent patterns in it. Level two followed a similar process but with regard to the entire set of data. It involved checking the validity of the themes individually and also considering whether the themes revealed meanings as a whole in the data set (Braun & Clarke, 2006). Then themes were defined and named by recognizing the essence of each theme and identifying the specific aspect the theme covered. A storyline was discovered for each theme that was related to the overall anecdote the data established (Braun & Clarke, 2006).

Findings

The researchers followed the six phases of thematic analysis rigorously to explore answers to the research questions. The following tables show only the last four phases including the searched themes, refined themes, definitions of the themes, and a storyline that is developed for the refined themes.

Table 1 *Themes: Searched and Refined*

Searched Themes	Refined Themes
"Love and Beauty" • Beauty and love are blessing • Beauty is mortal	• Love and beauty as blessings • Mortality/Beauty and Immortality/Love

• Love is immortal • Temporariness of love • Mortality leads to rebirth • Love is afflictive • Love is remedy	• Love: Affliction vs Remedy
"Come and Tell Me Pious Priest" • Big questions about absolute truth • Life is a sacrifice • Afflictions • Escapism • Meaning of life **"Oh Young Man"** • Misery • Self-realization • Pride • Sufferings • Past-glory • Rejuvenation	• Big Questions: Absolute truth (meaning of life) • Sacrifice • Escapism • Misery (sufferings and afflictions) • Honor (steadfastness, pride) • Past-glory • Rejuvenation • Self-realization (Self-accountability) • Panther (Self-belief, Bravery)
"Go My Child! Proceed Apace!" • Honor • Steadfastness • Self-accountability • Self-belief • Bravery • Sacrifice • Rejuvenation • Panther	

TABLE 2 *Definitions of the Refined Themes*

Refined Themes	Definitions
· Love and beauty as blessings	Both love and beauty for Ghani are blessings from God showered upon man and nature respectively.

· Mortality/Beauty and Immortality/Love	Beauty is mortal for the poet, it wanes in time, contrarily, love is immortal it is not a prisoner of time.
· Love: Affliction vs Remedy	The conception of love is also binary; it gives pain, but it is also the remedy for that pain.
· Big Questions: Absolute truth	Ghani is often curious about existence, the very meaning and essence of life.
· Sacrifice	Ghani's poetry stresses the importance of sacrifice as an essential element of life's endeavors.
· Escapism	Ghani seems to believe in getting away from the wickedness and suffering in life into the unknown through questioning it.
· Misery	This theme in Ghani's poetry represents pain, suffering, and bleakness.
· Honor	Ghani is in a staunch pursuit of honor and preaches steadfastness and pride, which are the building blocks of having honor and being honorable.
· Past-glory	Ghani is proud of his past: the "Pashtun" past that he often refers to.
· Rejuvenation	Ghani is a believer in standing up once you have fallen and he urges upon candling a new spirit for success and rebirth.
· Self-realization	Ghani believes in looking inward and self-accountability for mending their ways and achieving greatness.
· Panther	The panther is the symbol of bravery and strength.

Discussion

Notion of Love

Ghani Khan's concepts of love and beauty are very similar to and different from the other poets. In the theme of "love and beauty as blessings", Ghani Khan portrays love as an endowment of God (Allah) on creation. He says that love is immortal and it defies the constraint of time that has imprisoned

everything else in the world including beauty, because beauty diminishes with time and only love remains persevered. Essentially, he calls humans ungrateful beings for not being content with the blessings of love as the following verses suggest:

<div dir="rtl">
مینه حقیقت حسن سایه د حقیقت ده
حسن له زوال شته مینه نه لری زوال
</div>

"For beauty must grow old and wane,
But love is deathless, eternal!"
(Sahibzada, 2014, p. 220-221).

Ghani Khan is calling love deathless, which will remain perpetually, and beauty will age and eventually die. However, Ghani's notion of love is unique as he believes that love is a binary enterprise, which gives afflictions, and its blossoms only last for a while, but this pain is remedied only by the love itself. The researchers believe that Ghani's conception of love has emerged from his life experiences. His son died during his lifetime which has given him immense pain that he expressed in various other poems. Meanwhile, he found solace in the company of his grandchildren and daughter-in-law "Nageen", on whom he had written a poem praising her character (Shahibzada, 2014). Further, this binary nature of the notion of love could be observed often in Ghani's verses as the following verses reveal:

<div dir="rtl">
هغې وی مینه دوذخ دی
ماشومان پکښی جلبا شی
ما وی ښه دوذخ ښه دی
له گناه وجود صفا شی
</div>

"She said, "Love is hot as Hell,
Lovers burn within it cry."
I said, "hell is ever welcome,
For it cleanses one of sin"."
(Sahibzada, 2014, p. 152-153).

These verses reveal Ghani's conception of love, as he does not shy away from the bitterness that love accompanies, and acknowledges the bitterness is sweetened by the very love that causes it, transformed only in shape.

Encounter with the Orthodox Preachers

Moreover, Ghani is perceived as an anti-preacher poet. Following the local tradition, he calls them *mullahs* and views them as the root cause of conflict in society (Awan et al., 2014). The researchers believe that this

cynicism focused on *mullah* in the analysis of Ghani's poetry is somewhat misplaced. Clarifying this assumption, the researchers suggest that understanding the entity represented by the figure of *mullah* is necessary. However, in Pashtun society specifically, a *mullah* is a person who leads daily prayers in a Masjid (Mosque). They are of two types: *Qari*, someone who has memorized the Holy Quran without its understanding, and *Alim*, a religious scholar who is an established personality with a deep understanding of both the religion and society. Ostensibly, the disgust shown by Ghani is directed towards the first type, who lacks the perception of the intricacies between religion and society. The Pashtun masses consistently visit these types of *mullahs* without making a distinction and seek advice about their daily affairs, leading to the deep dissent visible in society.

Furthermore, the researchers suppose that Ghani might have encountered the *mullah* differently from the traditional perception. For instance, the theme of "Big questions: Absolute Truth", where Ghani is asking about the meaning of life, is essentially a whole bunch of questions that are posed to the *mullah* in the poem "Come and Tell Me Pious Priest". It represents a diversion from the typical mistrust that Ghani is perceived to have in the *mullahs*. This interaction engages him with the second type of *mullah* about the serious thought-provoking questions on existence and life, such as:

<div dir="rtl">

واپه واپه ملا جانه

موندل وصل که بیگار دی------

دا خودی خاوري کول دئ

</div>

"Pious priest! Oh, come and tell me,
Is to search for a means of worship,
Or just forced labour, extracting?"
(Sahibzada, 2014, p. 120-121)

Ghani is asking the *mullah* about a journey to find oneself, asking him whether it is a form of worship or just another tiresome job that humans indulge in.

"Sacrifice" is a consistent theme that emerges in Ghani's poetry, observed in the poems "Come and Tell Me Pious Priest" and "GO My Child! Proceed Apace". The researchers believe this theme is embedded in the life of Pashtun people among whom Ghani was born and bred. Ghani's father Bacha Khan is a prime example of sacrifice who had dedicated his entire life including his family for the uplift and freedom of Pashtun society (Sahibzada, 2014). However, Ghani's life is full of sacrifices when he was sent to the UK at the tender age of fifteen to attain Western education to

perceive their lifestyle for transforming his people. Ghani also spent six years in jail for the cause of uplifting his people (Sahibzada, 2014). Further, the poem "Come and Tell Me Pious Priest" portrays the theme of sacrifice:

كه صلیب دی او عیسی دے
داذغو تاج ہی په سر
كه حسین او كربلا ده

"Or the cross with Christ upon it,
Prickly thorns upon his head?
Or Hussain and Karbala?"
(Sahibzada, 2014, p. 120-121)

Alluding to the crucifixion of Christ (PBUH), and the martyrdom of Hussain (May God be pleased with him) in Karbala, Ghani is asking the *mullah* whether the meaning of life is to sacrifice yourself for your people. The researchers also found "escapism" as a consistent theme where Ghani seems to believe in transitioning into oblivion in the face of wickedness that life presents in the shape of suffering, and the struggle to find the ultimate truth. Ghani depicts this opinion in the encounters with the second type of *mullah* when engaging him in deep questions about life and the purpose of life, such as:

كه يو ساز خان ته غريزی
چی دا خپل غمونه هپرکری
دا سپرلی دی كه يو گل دی
لر پټ شوی د خزانه

"….. Or a self-beguiling tune,
Leaving all its woes behind?
⋯.…That's in hiding for the time,
From autumn's searing wind?"
(Sahibzada, 2014, p. 120-121)

In the poem "Come and Tell Me Pious Priest" researchers argue that Ghani suggests that forgetfulness might be the answer to the daunting problems through music or maybe the meaning of life is to ditch oblivion for a certain period.

Address to the Youth Entrenched in Cultural Bleakness

The theme of "misery" is prevalent in the poetry of Ghani, representing the sub-themes of pain, suffering, and bleakness. The researchers believe this theme is central to Ghani Khan's poetry. The social, political, and

economic situation of Pashtuns reflects this. Ghani was from a family of politicians, and he took part in politics for a limited period (Sahibzada, 2014). The authors suggest Ghani's exposure, as mentioned above, to the Western lifestyle and elsewhere made him realize the pathetic living circumstances of his people. The following verses speak volumes about the theme of misery in the poem "Oh Young Man"

اے دہ وری بچی پلاره
..... بی درکه سر گردانه
"Oh young father of the child-
Who for want of food is hungry…..
You're distressed, pre-occupied;.."
(Sahibzada, 2014, pp. 284-287)

These verses reveal the cultural bleakness of Pashtun society that has rendered their children privy to the necessities of life and are suffering inconsequentially at the hands of manipulators.

Another recurrent theme in Ghani's poetry is "honor". Ghani actively pursues honor and preaches both pride and steadfastness: subthemes that are integral to achieving honor. The researchers suggest that this is a general attribute of the Pashtun people who are very proud of their identity and land. Fundamentally, this theme floats in the poetry of Ghani on multiple levels, whether he is engaged with the "*mullahs*", addressing *the youth*, commenting on *cultural problems*, or expressing *love*. Ghani never compromises on the reins of honor believing it to be the bedrock of all the encounters in society. Irrespective of the circumstances, honorable people will always come out triumphant as they are steadfast and proud in their endeavors. Ghani expresses this belief as follows:

ته د مينځ اسمان وی ستوری
ستا شمله چی شوه پورته
په مستیاوننگ به سر وی
"Brightest star of firmament!
When the turban graced your head,
……Filled with honour and with pride,"
(Sahibzada, 2014, pp. 284-287)

In the poem "Oh Young Man" Ghani seems to remind the young men about their status when they had their honor intact; they were graceful people, distinctive in society, and people had to follow them. Likewise, in the poem "Go my Child! Proceed Apace", the researchers suggest Ghani is urging the youth to be steadfast in the following verses:

خوب کېني هم په شا نه شي
نه خُی پښتانه په شا

Even on dreams, do not retreat,
And never accept defeat,
Never do Pukhtoons withdraw, (Sahibzada, 2014, p. 296-297)

The poet is urging youth that their culture doesn't allow or believe in defeat, but rather standing upright to every obstacle is the way forward.

Nevertheless, the theme of "past glory" can be observed in Ghani's poetry. He is a proud Pashtun and commends his ancestors who had a glorious past, as they were leaders and conquerors. He reminds the young men of their history by taking lessons in the following verses:

ستا د لاس مانپی ولاړې
په دهلی په بنګا له دی

"Yet in Delhi and Bengal
There are monuments, which boast,
Of your power and your might!" (Sahibzada, 2014, pp. 284-287)

Referring to the conquests of Afghan leaders in India such as the Pashtun leader Ahmed Shah Abdali who had come to India and had defeated the Marathas and Sher Shah Suri who had ruled India (Qayum et al., 2017). The researchers argue allusion to the past is to develop a new vigor in the new generation.

Consequently, "rejuvenation" is apparent in Ghani's poetry, as he never lost hope despite the troubles and tribulations. In the resurgence with a new spirit, that should overwhelm all the pains and miseries, entering a new world established over the ruins of disbelief and suffering. Ghani constantly preaches the idea of rebirth to the young men, encouraging them through various examples, e.g., history, and reminding them of their harsh living conditions. The researchers believe living in despair and suffering for an extended period has rendered the Pashtun society, particularly young men, numb to the prevailing situations, considering it a norm, against which Ghani is striving to disseminate the idea of pursuing a better future which is better suits the Pashtun society. The poem "Oh Young Men" reveals this:

ائی د تېتو سترګو ځوانه
پاڅه هغه جهان جوړ کړه
د دی باغ خاوري راواخله
تری نه نوئ بستان جوړ کړه

"Oh young man with downcast eyes!
Rise! Create that other world;
From it once again create,
Scented flowers and perfumed air."
(Sahibzada, 2014, pp. 284-287)

Furthermore, the theme of "self-realization" is observed in this study. Ghani propagates self-accountability: a subtheme, he considers mending one's way of conducting their affairs is significant. This theme resembles the sheer realization that changing their circumstances requires the engagement of self-faculties. No outsider will sympathize and help you unless you are willing to do it yourself. This theme is observed in the poem "Oh Young Man".

اے چی ښکته ښکته ګورې
نن پښې ابله سر سر تور
ته خبر ئی چی ته څوک وې؟

"Oh one with downcast eyes of shame,
Barefoot, and uncovered head!
Do you know what you were once?"
(Sahibzada, 2014, pp.285-287)

Ghani in these verses is explicitly calling out the young Pashtuns, in a way shaming them to make them realize their self-worth and motivate them to work for their betterment. As in Pashtun societies, the idea of head covering reflects respect and Ghani uses that to provoke a sense of self-accountability in the Pashtun society and young men specifically.

Nevertheless, Ghani calls the young men "Panther", boosting them to act and become like a panther. The authors suppose Ghani has experienced a dynamic life both within the country and abroad, realizing the danger double-faced men present to the society including *politicians* and *mullahs* of the first type and some *mullahs* from type two that involve themselves in politics. The incident of the role played by type two *mullahs* in the ouster of Amir Amanullah in Afghanistan was afresh in Ghani Khan's mind and had a significant impact on his life (Sahibzada, 2014). Therefore, Ghani calls the young generation panthers, who must be cunning, strong, and brave, to tackle the wily fox. Ghani addresses young men about such people:

هر چلی دشمن زما
بد خوئی د لومبړی دے
زه د غرنو پړانگ ئمه

41

تل می دے خورلے دے

"Wily is my lifelong foe,
Offspring of the wily fox!
I'm a panther of the hills,
And have always preyed on him!"
(Sahibzada, 2014, p. 296-297)

These lines show Ghani's contempt for the shrewdness of certain elements of society, challenging them in an exquisite display of steadfastness and bravery, defying them in the best possible way and admonishing them, and getting his message across to the Pashtun youth as well, of prudence.

Ultimately, the researchers suppose the emerging themes during the probing of Ghani's poetry reflect the experiences of Ghani and nearly all the themes represent an aspect of his observation of the society and people around him. He is not bound to the themes found in his poetry; rather, the themes emerged because of his perception of the events around him. This makes all the themes seem relatable in terms of the construct of society he represents. Therefore, these themes represent the deep social, cultural, and political milieu of the Pashtun society in this endeavor of the researchers.

Conclusion

The analysis of Ghani's selected poems identified themes including love and beauty as blessings, mortality/beauty and immortality/love, love: affliction vs remedy, big questions: absolute truth, sacrifice, escapism, misery, honor, past-glory, rejuvenation, self-realization, and Panther.

Literature is deemed important for teaching English as a foreign language, which builds interpretive abilities in the target language (Ashrafuzzaman, Ahmed, & Begum, 2021). Literature provokes rational thinking in students (Ashrafuzzaman, Ahmed, & Begum, 2021). However, the selection of a text is crucial in English language teaching, when the text does not resonate with the students, it renders them uninterested as they cannot connect with it, hence leading to the practice of rote learning in developing language skills (Mohaideen, Ismail, & Rasheed, 2020). Choosing between local and foreign texts is crucial since literature divulges the nitty-gritty of life experiences (Mohaideen, Ismail, & Rasheed, 2020). The students will draw optimal benefits from local texts when they understand them well. Moreover, they will be able to improve their language skills. In addition, extending the above discussion, the researchers believe that this study will be pivotal for the notion of incorporating local language literature in

classrooms to enhance the interpretive abilities of students by connecting them with their immediate society. A deeper understanding of the text will also help the students in developing their language skills.

To the end of this discussion, point to some limitations of the study. Firstly, Ghani Khan has written hundreds of poems and a book named "Da Ghani Kulyat" was published in 1987 including almost seven hundred poems. This book was followed by another book namely "Latoon" published in 1995 which includes all his poetry (Sahibzada, 2014). However, the researchers have only explored five of the selected poems from the translated book of Ghani Khan's poetry and this shows that the size of the data is non-representative and cannot be generalized. Secondly, the word limit in this study did not allow the selection of extensive data for analysis, which would require more time. Thirdly, the researchers believe that the translated work from its original language (Pashto) might have impacted the original meaning and thought of the poet. There is a lot of room for research on the poetry of Ghani Khan. A potential research can be conducted using interviews for collecting data from the Pashto speakers, who are able to understand poetry for a greater insight into the themes that emerged from Ghani's poetry in the present study.

In the prevailing scenario of intolerance and unrest in Pakistan, the study recommends that Ghani's message of love be disseminated by making it part of the curriculum of English Literature at undergraduate-level programs in Pakistani universities.

References

Ahmed, M., Rabbi, F., & Ahmad, M. S (2022). Mysticism in Pashto Literature: The Reflection of Mystical Elements in the Poetry of Abdul Ghani Khan. *Pakistan Journal of Society, Education, and Language (PJSEL*), Vol.8, Issue1. https://pjsel.jehanf.com/index.php/journal/article/view/610

Ali, H., Abdullah, M., Bhatti, I. A., & Abbas, F. (2018). Poem for Children by Allama Iqbal: A Deconstructive Critique. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences,* 6(1), 59-67. https://doi.org/10.52131/pjhss.2018.0601.0033

Ali, S., Shah, S. H., Umar, S., Ahmad, Z., & Ali, K. (2022). A Stylistic Analysis of Ghani Khan's "The Pathan". *PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology,* 19(4), 1098-1107. ISSN 1567-214x

Awan, L. I. D. M. S., & Ali, I. U. N. (2014). Ghani Khan's poetry: A Modernist Perspective. *J. Appl. Environ. Biol. Sci,* 4(9S), 509-514.

Ashrafuzzaman, M., Ahmed, I., & Begum, M. (2021). Learning English language through literature: Insights from a survey at university level in Bangladesh. *Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies,* 17(S2), 1190-1209. 10.17263/jlls.904150

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006a). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative research in psychology*, 3(2), 77-101. 10.1191/1478088706qp063oa

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2022b). Conceptual and design thinking for thematic analysis. *Qualitative Psychology*, 9(1), 3-26 https://doi.org/10.1037/qup0000196

Shah, F., Gul, S., Khan, J., Anwar, M. (2021). Groping For The Shared And Unique Elements Through Juxtaposing Samuel Taylor Coleridge's And Ghani Khan's Poems:'Kubla Khan And Zama Mahal (My Palace) Under The Lenses Of Intertextuality. *Webology*, 18 (4). (ISSN: 1735-188x).

Hafeez, A. , Seemab, I.(2019). Conceptual Metaphors in Ghani Khan's poems" Saaz" and" Rishta". City University Research Journal of Literature and Linguistics, 2(1). http://cusitjournals.com/index.php/CURJLL

Iqbal, H., Khan, A. A., Bakhshali, S. Z. U., & Naz, A. (2022). An Eco-critical Study of Abdul Ghani's Poetry. *Pal Arch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology*, 19(2), 1394-1408. https://archives.palarch.nl/index.php/jae/article/view/11552

Khan, A. (2020). A Counter-Orientalistic Approach: Comparative Exploration of Thematic Universality in English Poet John Keats and Pashto Poet Ghani Khan. *HamdardIslamicus*, 43 (2), 818-832. https://hamdardfoundation.org/hamdard-islamicus/

Mohaideen, M. S. H., Ismail, H. H., & Ab Rashid, R. (2020). The Use of Local Literary Texts as Reading Materials in English Language Classrooms: An Analysis of Teachers' Perspectives. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research*, 19(11), 127-144. 10.26803/ijlter.19.11.8

Mushonga, M. C. (2018). Investigating the portrayal of social issues in Namibian post-independence poetry written in English (Doctoral Dissertation). University of Namibia). https://www.academia.edu/65352530/Investigating_the_portrayal_of_social_issues_in_Namibian_post_independence_poetry_written_in_English

Panecka, E. (2019). *Religious Experience in Modern Poetry*. Cambridge Scholars Publishing.

Qayum, H., Shah, Z., & Alam, J. (2017). Afghanistan in the historical perspective. *Global Political Review*, 2(1), 46-53. https://doi.org/10.31703/gpr.2017(II-I).05

Sahibzada, I, A. (2014). *The pilgrim of beauty.* Islamabad: The Army Press.

Safa, M. M., & Sahand, E. (2022). An Investigation of Philosophical Thoughts in Ghani Khan Poems. Randwick International of Education and Linguistics Science Journal, 3(1), 128-135. https://doi.org/10.47175/rielsj.v3i1.415

Stallworthy, J. (Ed.). (1986). *A book of love poetry*. Oxford University Press.

Appendix A
The Pushto Version of the Poems Interpreted in the Study

مینه او حُسن

ستوری ته اسمان کښې یوه ورځ ووې ، هلال

خدائی ادم له مینه ورکړه مونږ له تش جمال

زۀ به پۀ خندا ورکړم دا خپل خپښت ، د کمال

ما له کۀ یو څاڅکے مینه راکړی څوک پۀ سوال

مینه حقیقت حُسن سایه د حقیقت ده

حُسن له زوال شته مینه نۀ لری زوال

❧

وایه وایه مُلاجانه!

وایه وایه مُلاجانه!
موندل وصل کۀ بیګار دے
دا دلبر دے او جانان دے
کۀ قهار دے او جبار دے
دا خودی څاوری کول دی
کۀ خپل خود چرته موندل دی
کۀ یو خوب د ګلاب زړۀ کښې
نشه شوے پۀ بهار دے
دا سپوږمی او د سیند غاړه
د کوکو سخی دلبر
کۀ صلیب دے او عیسی دے
د ازغو تاج ئې پۀ سر
کۀ حسین او کربلا ده
بیابان دے او لهلا ده
کۀ څۀ هسې مشغولا ده
څۀ د زړۀ او څۀ د سر

چي پری خپل وزر راکبر کړی	دا یو دام شهباز جوړ کړے
چي دا خپل غمونه مهر کړی	کۀ یو ساز خان ته غږېږی
لږ پت شوے د خزانه	دا سپرلے ، دے کۀ یو ګل دے
وایه وایه مُلاجانه!	ژوند تپوس دے کۀ جواب دے

❧

مینه

اوس تازه وي او فنا شي	هغي وي مینه یو ګل دے
سل ګُلونه تري پېدا شي	ما وي یو ګل چي شي مراوے
سرے وُسیځی فنا شي	هغي وي مینه ده اور
جهان ګرم شي رنا شي	ما وي اور چي چرته بل شي
چي تري وېښ شي لا بلا شي	هغي وي مینه یو خوب دے
چي سرے وېښ شي شهدا شي	ما وي ګوره ژوندون خوب دے
سرے روند شي نابینا شي	هغي وي مینه غضب دے
تل جهان ته نابینا شي	ما وي خدائي ته بینا سترګي
ماشومان پکښي جلها شي	هغي وي مینه دوزخ دے
لۀ ګناه وجود صفا شي	ما وي بنۀ دے دوزخ بنۀ دے
پکښي خان ورک شي تالا شي	هغي وي مینه تیارۀ ده
پکښي پته سخا دُنیا شي	ما وي ګوره تیارۀ بنـــــۀ ده
کاشکي ستا عقل زما شي	هغـي وي خوږه دلبـــره!

اے د تیتو سترګو خوانه
پاڅه هغه جهان جوړ کړه
د دې باغ خاوري راواخله
تري نه نوے بستان جوړ کړه
اے د ویران خیبر سهرمني
اے د وږي بچي پلاره
بې درکه سرگردانه
اے د سوي باغ مالیاره
اے چي نن بربند بچي ستا
د خوراک پۀ کشاله دي
ستا د لاس مانۍ ولاړي
پۀ دهلي پۀ بنګاله دي
اے د بل د در مرثیيه
پاڅه هغه دوران جوړ کړه
د دې باغ خاوري راواخله
تري نه نوے بستان جوړ کړه
اے پۀ غرۀ پۀ سردرو کیني
پۀ باغونو پۀ مهرو کیني
پۀ چندول کیني پۀ تیر کیني
زما لال١ پټ پۀ ایرو کیني
اے د زرکو پۀ خندا کیني
دِ تنخرو پۀ نارو کیني
د شهر شاه نازبینه خویه!
تۀ شي پروت بورو تیرو کیني
کړه د غم تیري راغندي
تري د میني داستان جوړ کړه
د دې باغ خاوري راواخله
تري نه نوے بستان جوړ کړه

اے زما وطنه

سوے باغ، تالا ګلشن دے
مراوے ګل، خاوري چمن دے
نۀ بلبل نۀ لولکي شته
نۀ نرګس نۀ یاسمن دے
دا ګلاب دے ایري شوے
کۀ پۀ اور سوے ختن دے؟
اے پښتونه ستا وطن دے
اے پښتونه ستا وطن دے
د دې باغ خاوري راواخله
تري نه نوے بستان جوړ کړه
اے د سوي باغ مالیاره
د نورونو جهان جوړ کړه
اے چي بنګته بنګته ګوري
نن پښي ابله سر سرتورے
تۀ خبر شي چي تۀ څوک وې؟
تۀ د مینځ اسمان وې ستورے
ستا شمله چي به شوه پورته
شوۀ به بنګته شملي نورۍ
پۀ مستي او ننګ به سر وي
ستا دا تیتي سترګي توري

خه زما بچیه خه!

ستا کرم تا به (ئي) خان کرمه	یا بــــــــه دا تالا وطن
خاوري پۀ مېدان کــــرمه	یا به دا مغــرروره ســـر
بـــــــکُلی ازمریه خه!	خه زما بچـــــیه خه!
نۀ خی پښـــــتانۀ پۀ شا	خوب کښې هم پۀ شا نۀ شي
خان بچی د خان کـــرمه	یا به هر پښـــــتون بچی
دا به پــری قـــربان کرمه	نور خۀ دی دا سر می دے
توپ وهــــی لمبــی وهــی	وینه کښـــي می اور دے
دا وراني به ســـمي کړی	متو کښـــي می زور دے
تُوره پۀ مېدان کــــــرمه	زۀ چـــــــي کله وتی یم
یا به خاوري خان کــــرمه	یا به دشـــمن خاوري کړم
بیا شین گُلســــــتان کرمه	یا بــــــه دا تالا وطن
خاوري پۀ مېدان کـــــرمه	یا به دا مغـــرروره ســـر
بد خوئـــي د لوبـــري دے	هر چلی دُشـــــمن زما
تل مـــــی دے خورلی دے	زۀ د غـــرونو پــــرانگ یمه

A Corpus-Based Linguistic Analysis of the Menus in Lahore's Elite Cafes and Restaurants

Iram Sagheer[1*], Ayesha Gulzar[2], Fatima Suri[2], Komal Mahmood[2]

Abstract

Food makes a strong connection between a person and his culture. However, the culture is greatly influenced by the language, and a person can be easily identified by his food choices. Food is also a source of globalization, for example, we can easily find Chinese, Japanese, and Italian cuisines in Pakistan. The elite cafes and restaurants in Pakistan are offering menus with unique languages that do not represent our culture and social norms. One cannot find Pakistani cuisine with its traditional name on the menus of elite cafes and restaurants. They are under the influence of cultural imperialism. Cultural imperialism is the attempt to dominate another culture in our own traditions and values. This resulting cultural homogenization affects the lifestyle of people too. The menu writers are using international languages and cuisines to attract consumers. The names of the dishes and beverages are so weird and bizarre that a person can't get an idea of what the actual dish is without reading the description of the food item. The research aims to study the menu cards of fifty-five (55) elite-class restaurants and cafes in Lahore, Pakistan. Using purposive sampling in this corpus-study, we have analysed 200 names of different dishes and beverages from these upper-class eateries. The study clearly reveals that Pakistani cuisine and its traditional names are subservient to the international cuisine in Pakistan. This is a major threat to Pakistani food culture and lifestyle that needs to be taken into consideration by the restaurant owner and menu writers. They need to dwindle the availability of international cuisine more than our Pakistani food and the use of international language in naming their food items. The results of this research are an eye-opener for the protectors of Pakistani food culture.

Keywords: Cultural Imperialism, Corpus Linguistic, Cultural Homogenization, Identity, Cuisines, Menu.

[1] Lecturer, Department of Digital Media, University of the Punjab
[2] BS Scholar, Department of Digital Media, University of the Punjab
*Corresponding author's E-mail: eyumbhatti91@gmail.com

Introduction

Linguistics is the scientific study of language. It includes studying the sounds, words, grammar, and meaning used for communication in a certain language. Linguistic analysis involves the study of various aspects of a language and how they are acquired by individuals. It basically helps us study the complexity of human languages(Sagheer et al., 2024). General linguistics may be defined as the science of language. As with other branches of knowledge and science study, such as definition, it involves the subject in certain relations with other disciplines and sciences outside itself and in subdivision into different branches of the subject comprised within it (Robins, 2014). Highlighting the cultural identity of a person is a set of traits that he inherits from his cultural background. Culture involves traditions, customs, language, beliefs, and food. It is just having your personal fingerprint that includes or represents your traditions, language, customs, etc. The cultural identity of a person makes a man recognisable in a community. Food, in this regard, is one of the basic aspects of one's cultural identity. Culturally speaking, in essence, what one eats defines who one is and is not (Almerico, 2014). These two are closely interlinked. Food, recipes, ingredients, and cooking techniques. It helps to shape and express cultural identity. It is a powerful symbol of heritage.

Adopting one culture over another is cultural imperialism. Foreign food tastes and dishes inject into our culture by adding different dishes and cuisines to our restaurant menus. One small evidence of cultural imperialism took place in neighbouring countries. Most Hindus are vegetarians, but these days, Hindus are starting to eat non-vegetarian food. Cultural imperialism deals with affairs ranging from the ideological effects of imported cultural products to the process of cultural homogenization to the nature of cultural autonomy (Tomlinson, 1991). We surveyed 55 restaurants and came to the point that cultural imperialism and homogenization also comes into our society. The younger generation adopted foreign cultures and left our culture. As with food items, cultural imperialism and homogenization is starting to spoil our culture rapidly. The goal of including foreign dishes on the menu is to help foreigners understand foreign culture. But the negative impact of this evolution is that our cultural dishes come into danger.

In this research, we have linguistically analysed 55 menus of elite cafes and restaurants and the various expressions that are being used by our menu writers to appeal to their customers. Foreign vocabulary is now being used as a symbol of standard in our society, which may demolish our

traditional language. However, in today's globalised world, globalisation is one of the key components that made foreign dishes dominant over Pakistani food items and had a serious impact on Pakistani culture, beliefs, and norms (Shah, 2019) The term basically defines how technology has connected the world (Shahzad, 2015). Moreover, it is through globalisation that we spread information, norms, culture, and other things to different countries across the world. Therefore, as mentioned in the study, Pakistan is famous for its desi cuisines, but as a result of globalisation, nowadays foreign dishes are ruling over Pakistani food items as our young generation is attracted to international dishes with unique names. So, it is globalisation that has played a part in promoting western culture by means of technology such as social media.

An interesting and diverse aspect of human culture and cuisine includes an extensive range of tastes, methods of cooking, and traditions from all around the world. Each cuisine tells a different tale by fusing topographical and historical components with cultural influences to provide delectable eating experiences. There is something for every palate, from the spiciness and scent of Indian food to the refined and delicate flavours of French cuisine. Italian, Thai, Mexican, Chinese, and Japanese cuisines have become popular around the world for their unique ingredients and preparation methods. More than any other aspect of human civilization, cuisines and food ways, according to (Timothy, 2015), offer invaluable insight into the evolution of humanity. Exploring cuisines provides insight into a particular region's culture and traditions in addition to providing wonderful food. A cuisine is something fresh and appetising that is just waiting to be explored in the vast and different world due to the usage of local ingredients, the significance of a particular cuisine during festivals or festivities, and the ways of cooking.

In recent years, there has been a noticeable shift in Pakistan's culinary scene, with traditional favourites like biryani and kebabs facing increasing competition from foreign dishes. Many restaurant owners seem more captivated by international cuisines, reflecting the influence of globalisation, travel, and media on consumer preferences. While embracing global flavours can enhance culinary diversity, it's crucial to strike a balance between preserving Pakistan's rich food heritage and exploring international influences. Biryani, with its aromatic spices and flavourful rice, is an emblem of Pakistani cuisine and should not be overlooked. To maintain this balance, restaurants can draw inspiration from foreign cuisines while upholding the authenticity of their local traditions. Ultimately, Pakistan's food culture can continue to evolve by

blending traditional and international elements. By doing so, restaurants can honour beloved dishes like biryani while embracing the exciting possibilities of a more diverse culinary landscape, ensuring that both locals and visitors can savour the best of Pakistan's culinary traditions. This study focuses on the vocabulary of Lahore's elite restaurants or café menus to understand how it represents Pakistani food and its association with societal stigma. Cultural homogenization is not only affecting the lifestyle of Pakistanis but also their choices for local products. Moreover, it will help us to comprehend how the menu targets its customers and what's the relationship between food, society, and language.

Research Questions:

1. Which elite restaurants or cafés in Lahore are offering an exclusive and unique language menu?

2. What type of language is used by these restaurants and cafes to name the courses and beverages on their menu, causing cultural homogenization?

3. How are these elite restaurants or cafés using vocabulary as a tool to appeal their customers and affect their lifestyle?

4. What are the factors behind cultural homogenization?

Statement of Problem:

Language fluctuates with time because of social, cultural, and political impacts. In this era of globalisation, a wide range of food companies and brands are adopting new ways to enhance their marketing strategies for selling their products(Sagheer Malik et al. 2023). These homogenising forces are not only marketing their brands but also imposing their lifestyle on consumers. It is now becoming a trend to name cuisines under the influence of cultural imperialism. Food items and dishes in elite restaurants and cafes all over the world typically exhibit unique names, which are either their marketing tactics or ways to attract customers' attention. This study highlights the vocabulary of Lahore's elite restaurants or cafes, which shows that cultural homogenization is happening in the name of globalisation and that international cuisine is now preferred over Pakistani cuisine which is affecting the essence of Pakistani food language and lifestyle.

Literature Review

In late 20th century, in United states Cultural imperialism had two most important objectives. One of them was economic and the other was political (Petras, 1993). Now a days, Cultural imperialism revolves around social media which makes fancy cafes serve food and drinks that are inspired by popular traditions, which makes local food less in demand and makes prices so high that a common man couldn't afford them. Cultural imperialism is a concept in which a country's way of life, norms, food, music, etc. are imposed on another country. This study highlights the issue of cultural imperialism, as we have discussed how foreign food items have ruled out Pakistani dishes. A major factor in cultural imperialism is our media, through which our young generation gets attracted and wants to follow that specific culture that is being hyped. In this manner, they feel up-to-date as they have not lost track of being Gen Z. Hence, the effects of globalisation can be seen everywhere.

Moreover, advisers play a crucial role in promoting cultural imperialism and distracting the young generation from different cultural beliefs or norms. When any dominant culture spreads its values, traditions, etc. over other cultures, cultural imperialism can clearly be seen in that nation. It may happen through social media, foreign content, globalisation, etc. It is affecting the food culture of many nations. As we know that half of the Pakistan's population is Generation Z. Gen Z is the most speedy and sprightly than any other generation. They opened there eyes in world brim-full with globalization (Jamal, 2020) that why most people in developing countries like Pakistan are switching to western culture and food, as can be seen in our elite restaurants and cafes. Not only are trending cafes and restaurants serving us with western tastes, but they are also using western languages in their menus to attract consumers. This eventually leads to demolishing our own identity.

Cultural imperialism may lead to the loss of the identity of one culture or nation. As we know, cultural imperialism usually takes place in a country or nation. Pakistan is a developing country economically and culturally, and it is facing serious cultural imperialism in the present years. Our traditions, food, tastes, customs, and values are greatly dominated by western culture. Culture imperialism is a good thing, but it also has a negative impact. We adopted the foreign culture's food and left the traditional food behind. Through this method, our culture and traditional food have become unpopular. The other thing is that foreign cultures are based on their religion, but our religion is different from that of western

countries, so some dishes are not allowed in our religion and culture. For instance, pig meat is haram in our religion, but it is normal in foreign countries. So, cultural imperialism has a good impact, but we cannot dismiss its negative impact.

If we relate Cultural imperialism to Linguistics, than according to (Phillipson, 1992), Linguistic Imperialism is actually a prime ingredient of Cultural imperialism accompanied by technological, media and educational imperialism as its other elements. It accomplishes Linguistics and Cultural discrimination in middle of English and other languages. Cuisine is somehow the style of how people of different countries and culture cook. Every person naturally has a taste of his own culture. Cuisines is all about different ingredients, flavours, cooking styles, tastes, etc and all these things make one taste differ from others cultures taste. According to *Edward B. Tylor*, 'Culture is that comprehensive entity which embraces faith, knowledge, ethics, art, legislation, traditions, and other abilities and consistencies attained by a person as a member of this community (Tylor, 1871). An Italian annalist of Food and Culture states that, 'Cuisines is the set of implementation, understanding, strategies, and norms in cooking. (Montanari, 2006). He highlighted the historical and cultural factors of Cuisine in his article. Furthermore, Fast food is one of the most visible forms of cultural imperialism. Elite cafes and restaurants like Tim Hortons, PF Chang, etc. have western-style fast food that can replace our traditional food. Someone who exchanges food is beneficial for both countries, like introducing new flavours, serving styles, and cooking methods. But the increase in food exchange will affect the traditional food, or sometimes it will also affect the agricultural food production system. There are many other food trends that can be composed of or introduced by western countries that spread rapidly in other countries, and they also affect traditional foods, for instance, hamburgers, sushi, prawns, etc.

Cultural homogenization refers to the lessening of cultural diversity as different cultures adopt similar practices, media, and values. This can be driven by globalization, where exposure to a dominant culture leads to the erosion of local traditions. It can have both positive and negative consequences, promoting understanding but also potentially leading to cultural loss. It leads to a blending or merging of cultural elements, which can happen in various domains, including language, cuisine, fashion, music, and values(Robertson, 1995). As people and ideas move more freely across borders, cultural exchange becomes more common, and distinct cultural boundaries begin to blur. An example of cultural

homogenization in food is that regardless of the variety of native and domestic cuisines on a global scale, the United States fast food culture dominates a significant portion of the global food market. Street food or fast food from other cultures, such as Momos, Tacos, Hot dogs, Burgers, etc., are also blended into the worldwide homogenised food culture along with insignificant variations.

Moreover, Food is the true representative of one's cultural identity. In present days, the food our youngsters are opting for are questioning their identity. In menus of elite cafes and restaurants, weird names and expressions are used to name dishes that has no direct link with the actual dish. This trend can easily be observed through the conducted research (Ali, 2019). Explicit techniques were used to discourage the unhealthy eating but all in vain. As the language written on the menu is the main communicator between the consumer and the server. Implicit techniques were practised which proved to be beneficial in discouraging unhealthy diet.(Gynell et al., 2022). Menus in fancy restaurants are like a fascinating mix of culture, food, and language. These special menus go beyond just listing meals – they capture the spirit of a place's food traditions and how they're described. It is like a journey through different cultures on a plate, where every dish tells a story. The words they use to describe the food are like a form of art, painting pictures in your mind and making you feel something special. So, when you dine at these upscale places, you are not just eating; you are experiencing a blend of culture, cuisine, and language that makes it a unique and exclusive adventure. In fancy restaurants, the menus are like special books that tell stories about different cultures through their food. The words they use to describe the dishes are like paintings that make the food sound exciting and unique.

Research Methodology

The primary concern of this qualitative descriptive research is to linguistically analyse the names of food and drinks offered at expensive cafes and restaurants in Lahore. We added a total of 200 names of elite cafes and restaurants for the final study. As we know that the data gathered for this corpus study is qualitative which is based on purposive sampling technique by selecting the menus of fifty-five (55) elite cafes and restaurants found in the posh areas of the city. Corpus-based studies look at corpora, which are often examined by researchers. Corpora are collections of text that have been obtained using certain criteria. Corpus linguistics is an approach that investigates naturally occurring language using a corpus(Mozaffari & Moini 2014). These elite cafes and restaurants

were selected after analysing their menu which were available on the internet. We are in an era of social media, so the menus of many restaurants and cafes were easily available on their social media pages. Another reason for choosing these restaurants and cafes is that they are mostly visited by young adults who belong to an elite class. Although the preferred restaurants and cafes present an extensive range of food items, drinks, and sweets, only those items have been chosen in the study that carry unique names and simply have no relation with the recipes or food items at all. It had no connection with the local Pakistani culture. The names are linguistically analysed to understand the relationship between culture and language. Language and culture play an important role in building our ideologies.

Data Analysis

The majority of the names given to the food and drinks available in the cafes and restaurants chosen for the research are unusual and differ from the traditional Pakistani culture. The unique names written on the menus of these elite cafes and restaurants are the outcome of the writers who wrote that menu using various expressions encouraging unique cultural identity but these names are mismatched or oddly synchronize with the Pakistani identity. The language used in the menus of these restaurants and cafes is greatly influenced by foreign culture which is a great menace for the identity of our culture. The list of all elite cafes and restaurants that are used for this research is enlisted in the appendix. The analysis of menus is given below.

Language as an Expression of Violence and Aggression:

Different elite class restaurants and café menus are the centre of attraction of our young generation who are attracted towards violence and brutality. These menus have diverse and strange names of food items on their menus. Therefore, all the elite class eateries in Lahore have food menus with unique names that promotes violence, anger, viciousness and natural disasters. An example of a mocktail served at **London Courtyard**, an elite restaurant in Lahore, is *Bloody Berry,* and a mocktail served at **PF Chang** is named *Black Berry Blast*. Examples of beverages with such names include, *Thunder Lemonade, Blood Orange, Sky Bully, Bulletproof, Boost, Strike, Bloody Mary, Punch Juice, Death by chocolate, Luxe Punch, Lightening Shot, Strawberry Punch* and *Electric Soda.* Not only are such names assigned to different beverages but also to main eateries, fast food items and desserts.

Examples of name, conveying violence and aggression, assigned to desserts includes: *Molten Lava Cake* served at **Arcadian Cafe** and at **Tenerife Cafe** a brownie is served with name *Hit Me Brownie*. Furthermore, examples of such names assigned to other food items include: *Volcano Maki*, *Fish in Dragon Fire sauce*, *Hunter beef on Toast*, *Dynamite Shrimps*, *Bull Ride*, *Peeka boo Bomb*, *Dynamite Prawns*, *Dynamite Chicken*, *Loaded Queso Fries*, *Smash x BAO Burger*, *Buffalo Wings*, *Volcanic pickled Chicken*, *Wild Shitake Mushroom Steak* etc. In some restaurants like **Rina's kitchenette**, **La Cornucopia**, **Dahlia**, and **Saku Hana**, for instance, the names assigned to some burgers shows no connection with the food itself. Example include: *Rina's Smash Burger, Bang Bang Prawns, Saku explosion* and *Burning King of Fire Burger*. Words like E*xplosion, Fire, Smash and Dynamite*, speaks for violence and aggression in semantic field. Another example of beverage is *Red Punch* and *Knock Out the Flu* at **Wasabi**. Therefore, food items, which connotes violence and aggression, are shown as bringing about ferocity which turns eating into a fierce experience.

Language Denoting Disgust Food Items:

Food represents the culture and identity of every country. Its name should also sound delightful just like its smells or taste. The criteria for judging food by its look, fragrance, and title differ from one culture to another. Some countries have very different choices in selecting food names which is opposite to other countries. When people of one country visit to another country, they carry stored food items from their own country and some people have to survive on fruits and vegetables unless they find a restaurant where the food of their choice is available. One example of Chinese food which is very different from Pakistani food is *Kuai*. It is a famous dish of Chinese cuisine as it is made up of cut stripes of raw meat or fish but for Pakistanis it is only the raw fish that is enough to cause vomiting. Furthermore, raw meat is not eaten in our culture and religion. Another example of a Japanese dish is *Sashimi* which is also just like the *Kuai* but a little bit different. It is also made up of slices of raw fish. It has to be cooked well according to the local people. Not only can food selection become an issue because of the taste but also because of the names given to the dishes in some restaurants and cafes. When we started researching on menus of elite eateries, we came to know about the recipe of *Tuna melt*. Its name is based on very dangerous sea fish Tuna but when we went through the recipe it is a simple piece of bread with some cheese and some simple fish meat.

Similarly, there are some elite eateries in Lahore as well where food products and beverages are assigned names that sound abhorring and awful. These names are very nasty and disgusting for Pakistanis and it is enough to kill their hunger. For instance, *Ooey Gooey Brownie* where gooey literally means sticky, is serve at **Tattle Tea House**. Another example is of a main course food item is served at **PF Chang** with name *Dragon Roll*. Further examples include: *Rustica*, *Crispy Dragon Beef*, *Dragon fire Chicken*, *Firecrackers Prawns*, *Carnivora*, *The Dragon*, *Sticky Finger,* etc. In some restaurants names of those species are assigned to beverages and food items which are not even Halal. One example is of *Beef in Oysters* served at **Yum Chinese Thai**. Moreover, *Lava Balls* at **Noi Stir Fry Kitchen**, *Slow Drip Coffee* at **Soul Kitchen**, *Rattle Snake Pasta* at **Tenerife Cafe**, and other examples included *Prawn Bulldog Sauce, Cho Yuen Squids,* and *Chicken Chilli in Oyster Sauce*. The last name is showing that it is made up of oysters but in the recipe, no oyster is involved, it is simply cooked chicken with different sauces.

Language Depicting Geographical Labels; Showcasing Non-Native Identities:

Most of these restaurants have given their dishes or beverages names that are influenced by foreign cuisines. They have preferred foreign cuisines as compared to local ones. Some items carry the names of exotic lands making these dishes sound non-native. The menus of these elite cafes and restaurants are influenced by foreign areas because it is reputable in our contemporary society.

We can easily find *Thai soup*, *Mexican burgers, Thai red snapper and prawn, Russian salad, Italian pizza, French onion soup*, etc. It is easier to find *Bangkok chili chicken* at **The Skye restaurant**, *French vanilla* at **Tim Horton**, *Turkey potato salad* at **The Balcony**, *Thai red curry* at **The Brasserie**, *Moroccan chicken* at **Maribelle**, *Mexican Tostadas* at **London Courtyard**, *Beijing prawns* at **Yum Chinese and Thai**, *Thai Yam salad* at **Veera5**, *Sole Mediterranean* at **Tuscany Courtyard**, *UK Breakfast Steak* served at **Urban Kitchen** ---- in the elite restaurants and cafes located in the posh areas of Lahore. Whereas it is hard to find dishes named locally in these elite eateries. These restaurants avoid local names to maintain their status. Names like *Belgian chocolate tart* at **Rina's Kitchen** and *New York-style cheesecake, California Roll, Shanghai Sunrise, Mandarin Crunch Salad*, and *The Great wall of Chocolate* served at **PF Chang**, further build up the point. Likely, beverages named *Brazilian lemonade* at **The Balcony** and *Spanish latte* at **Tim Hortons** are indicating the same craze. At **Saku

Hana, an elite restaurant in DHA which is one of the posh areas in Lahore, there is a long list of items with foreign alliances like *California roll, Schezuan soup, Beijing beef, Thai clear soup*, etc. The same goes for **London Courtyard**, also located in DHA Lahore, with dishes like *London fish and chips, Moroccan grilled fish, Mediterranean grilled fish, Thai basil gal*, etc.

In some cafes and restaurants, the entire range of a menu is served with non-native names. For example, the *Korean menu* at **Mandarin Kitchen**, *Continental breakfast* at **Sasha's**, *Irish Breakfast* at **Butler's Chocolate Cafe**, and *Japanese menu* at *NOVU*. Somehow, some salads are also named according to the above trend, for example, *Thai chicken salad* at **Rina's Kitchen**, *Mexican bean salad* at **The Skye Restaurant**, and *Greek salad* at **English Tea House** is served. The supremacy of names of foreign places suggests that menu writers and consumers are enchanted by exotic and foreign cultures and places.

Language Usage of Collocations as Adjectives:

Adjectives that are used with some food items in many restaurants is to gain the attention of customers and to enhance the appetite of their customers. The common adjective that we find is 'Juicy', 'Sour', 'Spicy', 'crunchy', etc. They were commonly used in many traditional as well as fast-food restaurants. For instance, a continental dish named *Sautéed Vegetables* served at **Jade Cafe by China Town**, another dish is served with name *The Spicy Spider* at **Café de Como**, *Crispy Fried Calamari* served at **The Polo Lounge** and at **Tenerife Cafe** a drink is named *Virgin Mojito* and food items are named *Spicy Chicken Fingers, Mamma Mia Pizza,* etc. At **Arcadian Cafe**, an elite cafe in Gulberg, Lahore serves main course items named, *Creamy Mushroom, Crispy Onion Rings, Sizzling Chicken Fajita,* etc and in beverages a shake is named *Blue Lagoon* and Fruit flavoured drinks named *Purple Heaven and Lovely Day.* At **PF Chang** a salad is served named *Mandarian Crunch Salad Salmon* and a dish is served named *Spicy Tuna Roll*. Other examples include: *The Salty Cake, Sour chocolate, Bitter ice-cream, Crispy Duck, Dry Chicken Chilli, Crunchy Spicy Prawns, Chunky Chicken Sandwich, Skinny Iced Latte,* etc. But in most of the elite cafes and restaurants, they don't use these kinds of adjectives. They write the food names on their menu in such a way that give them a very exceptional meaning. For example*, Luxurious grilled cheese sandwich, Por Pia Tord, Yum special Ped, Haute cuisine fried chicken, Fiesty Chicken Tikka, Glazed Wings Parcel, Scraggy Eggs, Croque Monsieur,* etc. Inculcation of these words in menus as food items

becomes the symbol of elite cafes and restaurants. Young generation is enchanted by their names and order these items to look trendy and updated.

Language Endorsing Elite Status:

Globalization is focusing to erase unique cultural identities in third-world countries, while simultaneously promoting class-consciousness in various aspects, including the restaurant and cafe industry. In upscale establishments, the menu not only signifies class consciousness through high prices but also through the names given to dishes and beverages. It's important to note that food not only showcases cultural affiliation but also serves as a way to judge people's socioeconomic backgrounds. This is why some individuals purposely choose food items with names associated with the elite class.

It is not unfamiliar to find branded food items listed on the menus of elite eateries, which further strengthens class consciousness. This practice reflects an exclusive society driven by social class divisions. Examples of such food items includes: *The Veera Chinese Soup* served at **Veera 5,** *Yum special soup* and *Yum Rice* served at **Yum Chinese and Thai**, *LCR special club sandwich* and *LCR meat house* served at **London Courtyard,** B*alcony special beef burger* at the **Balcony**, *Wok special soup* served at **The Wok**, *Pantry special toast* served at **The Pantry**, *Tuscany fish and chips* served at **Tuscany Courtyard**, *Butler's signature* served at **Butler's Chocolate Café**, *Sumo Philadelphia roll* served at **Sumo**, *Taipan steamed Lapu-Lapu* served at **Taipan**, *Chang's Apple Crunch* served at **PF Chang**, *Rina's Classic Club Sandwich* served at **Rina's Kitchenette** and *NOVU special soup* served at **NOVU**, a mocktail named *Ferrari Bully* is served at **Arcadian Cafe,** *Royal Mei Kong Chicken* at **Mei Kong**, L'Amour Special Tea at **Cafe L'Amour**, *Brownie Ala Mode* at **Noi Stir Fry Kitchen**, *Gold Boost* at **Wasabi**, all of which carry brand labels to make them more appealing**.**

Language Promoting Sexual Imagery:

Menus showcasing sexual imagery are used to mesmerize consumers about food items. Many reputed international brands are using sexual imagery and clearly illustrate sexual pictures to promote their products, these brands include PETA, Victoria's Secret, Dallas Opera, etc. But now the trend of sexual imagery for promotion is not just restricted to international brands only. This trend has further grabbed the attention of menu writers of elite cafes and restaurants to name their food items. These

names of the items indicate sex clearly or vaguely. Sexual imagery is used in naming beverages, pizzas, other dishes, and especially desserts. For instance, a dessert is named *Drop it on me* at **Sweet Affairs.** Some other names of desserts with this imagery includes: *Melting Moments*, S*izzling Skillet Brownies*, O*h! My Chocolate, Melting Globe, Angel kiss, Temptation Cake, Passion Fruit Cheesecake*. Names of other food items that employ sexual imagery includes *Hot Garlic Prawns, Open Face Sweet and Sour Cheese Panind, Sizzler Steak, Buck Skin, Hot Ebi Union, and Hot Garlic Snapper.* Some beverages are named *Passion Fruit Mojito* and *Passion Fruit Green tea*. At the **Dessert Directory**, items are served named *After Eight Mint Galore, Lindt Indulgence in Dark, Coffee Oh So Natty.*

Gender Biased Language:

Gender biasness is an important issue that is being practiced in our culture irrespective you are working in an organization or staying at home. However, nowadays it became very offensive especially when we talk about women. There are many elite class restaurants whose food menus represents sexual aggression and disrespect towards women. For instance, **Dahlia** an elite cafe located in Gulberg, Lahore, a beef burger is named *Mother in law's Meatloaf*. It is clearly representing sexuality and aggression towards women and at an elite cafe named **Paola's Cosa Nostra,** a mocktail is served with name *Wonder Women.* Similarly, a drink name *Lady in Red* is served at **Tenerife Cafe,** a continental breakfast with name *Croque Madam* is served at **Sasha's**, **and** at **Howdy**, a popular place in Lahore has food item names like *Hot Cowgirl, Kick of a Chick* and *Wild chick*. Here we can see that 'cowgirl' is addressing sexuality whereas the word 'chick' also speaks the same aggression and not only pointing out to a young chicken but is also used as a slang to refer to a charming young lady or a teenage girl.

Personification in Language Usage to Adore Evilness:

Personification is a lingual device which is adopted in literature for introducing dormant object as human. The names given to some food items and beverages on the menus of most of the elite cafes and restaurants are so revolutionary that they are quite different from the real recipes. They show that unless one reads the description of the recipe, one cannot be convinced of what they really are. The sponsors also use this device consistently to fascinate consumers and menu writers are no special case in this regard. For example, at **Howdy** a steak is served with name *Gunslinger,* burgers are named *The Masher, The Basher,* and a wrap is named *Monsta Wrap*. These words are related to crime which eventually

is a result of sinful and evil practices. Moreover, at **PF Chang** a dish is served as *Midnight Ritual, Rising Dragon, and Kung Pao Dragon Roll.* Here the word 'dragon' shows evilness and in many religions and traditions, dragon is symbolized as malicious chaotic creature and of untamed nature. At **London Courtyard** a main course item is served with name *Dragon Fire Pot Chicken* and a beverage named *Monster shake.* At **Mandarian Kitchen** a food item is served with name *Dragon Noodles.* Such names do not show any direct or indirect connection with the food item itself. Using such names in menus glorify evilness and crime which is not practical in our culture.

Language Exalting Divergence in Lifestyle:

Words are an effective tool in shaping people's thoughts. The influential adaptation of words has a significant impact in transforming certain thoughts of people and their perceptions about things around them. By altering words or choosing words in an effective manner, people can change their insights regarding things that might once considered prohibited and forbidden in our society and culture. Concepts regarding such things can also be changed by persistent exposure to them and things related to them. Words can change an unacceptable thing to an admirable one. Here are some examples of the words that are used in the elite cafes and restaurants of Lahore in this regard. At **Howdy**, a burger is named as *Wrangler* which literally means a person who wrangles or disputes and a dessert is presented with the name of *Chocaine* which shows the amalgamation of chocolate and cocaine. At **Tin Roof**, a beverage is named as *Red-Eye* and further examples of beverages include: *Minty Madness, Electrical ease,* etc. The above used words cannot be used in a positive sense. The term like *Wrangler and Chocaine* are used as negative connotation and indicate destruction. Similarly, *Pad Ki Mao* at **Noi Stir Fry Kitchen** is representing fried noodles but literally it means 'drunk'. *Godspell Beef Load* at **Broadway** is also glorifying people's thought. **Boba teas**, where Boba means large breasts, are now available at many restaurants. Regardless of their negative connotations, the writer has included these words as food items to change the perception of young generation. This has become a trend now. This trend is changing people's perception of wrong and right by honouring such words. By using negative connotations, menu writers are helping in glorifying a deviant lifestyle.

Language Depiction of Foreign Fictional and Fairy Tale Characters:

Now a days in order to get attention of children and youngsters, the menu writers of some elite eateries have given the names of unreal characters

like in cartoons and movies to certain dishes and beverages. Teenagers and children order dishes and beverages that have imaginary and fictional names not essentially because of the food item or its taste but because they are attracted to those words or like those characters whose names are given to those items. For instance, on the menu of **Arcadian Cafe**, a creamy shake with the name of fairy tale character, *Pink Barbie* is served. Similarly, at **Coco Cubano**, an elite restaurant in Gulberg, Lahore, a coffee is served which is named *Piccolo*, a famous fictional character from James Baddock novel *Piccolo.* Furthermore, at **Howdy,** a food item is named *The Lord of the Wings* and at another elite restaurant **Maribelle,** in DHA Phase 5, desserts are served with the name *Whimsical Fairy Floss* and *Maribelle's Cheesecake,* they are mostly ordered by girls as they always fantasize fairy tales. At **PF Chang** a dish is served named *Buddhas feast* and at **Sumo** a dish is named *Buddha bowl,* at **London Courtyard**, food items are named *Mini Man Burger, Space Getti and Sindbads Carpet* from kids' menu, *Berry Blitz* at **Butler's Chocolate Cafe**, and at **Café Aylanto** a cocktail is served with name *Zombie*. Another example is *Phantom* means 'ghost' serve at **Broadway**. Now we should not be amazed by this that none of the food items and beverages in these elite eateries is named after any Pakistani fictional character. There are only fictional characters that are glorified by foreign culture.

This corpus-based research reveals that cultural imperialism is happening in our food sector, which is due to the dominance of western media and cultural food items. The diffusion of western culture is affecting our Pakistani lifestyle and food choices. These markets are selling what is desired by consumers who are under the influence of western culture. Though there is a rise in consumerism, this is resulting in the loss of traditional knowledge and practices. Cultural hegemony and power imbalances are also resulting in and leading to a loss of diversity.

Conclusion and Recommendations

Food symbolises one's culture and tradition; therefore, it holds significant importance for the country you are living in. It reflects people's identities, thus promoting the tradition all over the world. However, as discussed in this research, our people are busy carrying the foreign culture by promoting and fantasising about elite-class dishes and beverages. Lahore is one of the most famous cities in Pakistan with respect to food and cultural heritage, but these days it has not only resulted in the replacement of local dishes with foreign cuisines due to cultural imperialism and

homogenization but has also led to a change in traditional food terminologies with weird, culturally strange, and unique terms.

It is evident through our corpus-linguistic analysis that we have lost Pakistani taste and tradition while promoting western culture. As discussed in this study, our young generation is attracted by the new trends set by our society. Therefore, from the fifty-five (55) elite-class restaurants and cafes, the 200 names of dishes and beverages that we have analysed, indicate and promote the supremacy of weird and strange names of food items in Lahore. Elite-class menus have focused more on foreign cuisine than promoting Pakistani cuisine. This is a clear sign of being dominant, as our youth are very much attracted to dishes like *Bang Bang Prawns*, *Smash x BAO Burger, Peek-a-boo Bomb*, etc. over Pakistani cuisine. They prefer desserts named *Hit Me Brownie* or *Oh! My Chocolate*, on Kheer or Halwa. Energy drinks and Mocktails like *Lightening Shot, Death by Chocolate, Sky Bully* and *Zombie* have taken the place of fresh juices and cold drinks. Chinese rice on Biryani or Pulao. As it seems cool and up-to-date to them instead of being called old school.

Cultural homogenization occurs when any society emphasises or de-emphasises certain parts of your identity. If your identity is disapproved by your surrounding people, you search for new individuality and only display that aspect in order to fit in. This includes frequently sacrificing your wardrobe, cuisine, language, and name as well. This loss increases with prejudice and occurs when culture is lost, resulting in cultural homogenization. This research depicts that Pakistani people are losing their cultural identity and are influenced by other western cultures, which is the main reason for this cultural homogenization, specifically generation Z, who is inspired by K-pop culture. Another important factor of this cultural homogenization in Pakistani society is the availability of new products and services influenced by the western culture that these restaurants are providing. People want to be at the best location for food, and these restaurants offer what they want to buy. The pressure in business is sink or swim; without sales, these markets would fail, thus it cannot escape cultural homogenization. If people you are associated with or in your community believe that everyone's individualism or culture is acceptable, homogenization will be reduced.

The research also indicates that we should stand by our traditions and all these elite-class restaurants should promote Pakistani cuisines by going with decent and local food names that we have been using previously instead of foreign food names that mostly promote aggression and

violence, gender bias, and those that sound abhorrent and disgusting, as mentioned in this research. However, we should create awareness about our Pakistani cuisines. We should divert the attention of elite cafes and restaurants towards making room for local Pakistani dishes on their menus, as most of these restaurants serve Chinese, Japanese, Italian, French, and Korean food items, but there are only a few Pakistani dishes on their menus, which are also disappearing with time due to cultural homogenisation.

References

Ali, S. S. (2019). Food for Thought: A Linguistic Analysis of the Menus in Karachi's Elite Cafes and Restaurants. *Journal of English Studies, 9(01) - 1-12.*

Almerico, G. M. (2014). "Food and identity: Food studies, cultural, and personal identity." Journal of International Business and Cultural Studies **8**: 1.

Gynell, I., et al. (2022). "The effectiveness of implicit interventions in food menus to promote healthier eating behaviours: A systematic review." Appetite **173**: 105997.

Jamal, A. (2020). Generation Z in Pakistan: Individualistic and collectivist in orientation. The new Generation Z in Asia: Dynamics, differences, digitalisation, Emerald Publishing Limited**:** 105-117.

John Tomlinson (1991). "Cultural Imperialism." Retrieved 19 september, 2023, from https://press.jhu.edu/books/title/1394/cultural-imperialism#book__information.

Massimo Montanari (2006). "Food Is Culture." Retrieved 19 September,2023, from https://cup.columbia.edu/book/food-is-culture/9780231137904.

Mian Muhammad Ahmad Shah (2019). "Globalisation and its impact on Pakistan." Retrieved 20 september, 2023, from https://www.nation.com.pk/10-Jun-2019/globalisation-and-its-impact-on-pakistan.

Mozaffari, A. and R. Moini (2014). "Academic words in education research articles: A corpus study." Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences **98**: 1290-1296.

Petras, J. (1993). "Cultural imperialism in the late 20th century." Journal of Contemporary Asia **23**(2): 139-148.

Phillipson, R. (1992). " Linguistic Imperialism." Retrieved 21 september, 2023, from https://www.scirp.org/%28S%28351jmbntvnsjt1aadkposzje%29%29/reference/referencespapers.aspx?referenceid=3030731.

Robertson, R. (1995). "Glocalization: Time-space and homogeneity-heterogeneity." Global modernities **2**(1): 25-44.

Robins, R. H. (2014). General linguistics, Routledge.

Sagheer, I., et al. (2024). "Non-Verbal Communication Through Visual Storytelling: UMBRELLA Animated Short Film." Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review **8**(1): 277-292.

Sagheer, I., et al. (2023). "A Semantic Analysis of Pakistani Commercial Slogans through the Lens of Leech's Theory." Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review **7**(3): 940-949.

Shahzad, M. (2015). "Impact of Globalization on Pakistan." Young ISSI Professionals' Corner Institute of Strategic Studies, LUMS, Lahore.

Timothy, D. J. (2015). Heritage cuisines: Traditions, identities and tourism, Routledge.

Tylor, E. B. (1871). Primitive culture: Researches into the development of mythology, philosophy, religion, art and custom, J. Murray.

APPENDIX:

List of all elite cafes and restaurants in Lahore:

1. Amu
2. Arcadian Café
3. Boba Teas
4. Broadway
5. Butler's Chocolate Café
6. Cafe Aylanto
7. Cafe de Como
8. CAFÉ L'AMOUR
9. Coco Cubano
10. DAHLIA
11. Deja by Khadija
12. Desert Directory
13. El Momento Lahore
14. English Tea House
15. Fuchsia Kitchen
16. Fujiyama Restaurant
17. GAI A Japanese Restaurant
18. Howdy
19. Haute Dolci
20. Jade Cafe by China Town
21. La Cornucopia
22. London Courtyard
23. Mandarian Kitchen
24. Maribelle
25. Mei Kong
26. MON CHERI
27. Nando's
28. Noi Stir Fry Kitchen
29. NOVU
30. Paola's Cosa Nostra
31. Pasta la vista
32. Penthouse Lahore
33. PF Chang
34. Rina's Kitchenette
35. Saku Hana
36. Sasha
37. Soul Kitchen
38. Sumo
39. Sweet Affairs
40. Taipan
41. Tattle Tea House
42. Tenerife Cafe
43. The Balcony Lahore
44. The Brasserie
45. The Pantry
46. The Polo Lounge
47. The Skye Restaurant
48. The Wok
49. Tim Hortons
50. Tin Roof Café
51. Tuscany Courtyard
52. Urban Kitchen
53. Veera5
54. Wasabi
55. Yum Chinese and Thai

Introducing Discourse-Based English Teaching in Pakistan: The Systemic-Functional Grammar and Visual Grammar Perspectives

Muhammad Aslam[1*], Syed Danish Nasir[2]

Abstract

In Pakistan, English is taught as a second language at all tiers of education. But the goal of a desirable discourse competence has never been attained despite several attempts to overhaul syllabus and material development process. The purpose of this reflective paper is to explore an approach to English that will invigorate the efforts being made to develop discourse competence of Pakistani learners. Communication is developed through communication and a concrete model of communication was offered by Halliday in form of his Systemic-Functional grammar. The model has successfully been employed in Australia, Asia, Europe, and even USA. As communication is rapidly shifting to multi-modal means, Visual Grammar is also worthwhile in suggesting the way out to deal with new communicative challenges faced by Pakistani learners of English. To achieve this purpose, an overview of the notion of discourse, main developments in the field of discourse, models of integration of discourse studies with English Education, possibilities and challenges in implementing discourse oriented practices in English learning in Pakistan were discussed with a critical and professional lens. The reflection on the purposefully selected literature reveals that a shift to the discourse paradigm is inevitable for developing discourse competence of the learners. The deliberations in the paper conclude with suggestions for planning and implementation of discourse based English teaching in Pakistan.

Keywords: Systemic-Functional Grammar, discourse competence, multi-genre texts, visual grammar, English teaching in Pakistan.

[1] Assistant Professor, Department of ELT & Linguistics, IER, University of the Punjab, Lahore

[2] MPhil Applied Linguistics (Scholar), Department of English, University of Central Punjab, Lahore.

[*]Corresponding author's E-mail: aslam.ier@pu.edu.pk

Introduction

The current is the age of multimodal texts and multi-literacies which challenges the dominance of the verbal mode and related linguistic discourse analysis traditions (Stonecipher, 2020; Gee, 2018; Rose, 2016). These developments, among others, have impacted literacy practices and language teaching. In Pakistan, English teaching at all tiers still needs to be more consistent with traditional language modes for teaching literacy skills and literature. Consequently, this approach deprives the learners of understanding the entire process that produced the texts. The purpose of this review paper is to get an insight into this problem regarding Pakistan in the light of research and practices utilized around certain parts of the world. The primary objectives of the current review include exploring a research-based foundation to ascertain discourse-based teaching of English in Pakistan; highlighting the strengths and weaknesses of the multimodal approach to ELT; suggesting alternatives to the conventional linguistic strategies for English teaching; and highlighting the prospects and problems for implementation.

[*These opening lines highlight that the context of reflections is English teaching situation in Pakistan]*.

Rising Interest in Discourse Analysis

Jaworski (2020) surmises that recent interest in discourse is the result of two simultaneous developments: the "linguistic turn" in epistemology, whose central belief is that language is the crucial ingredient in the constitution of knowledge. The other is the broadening of the "inward-looking discipline" of Linguistics. These perspectives now have started looking beyond the sentence and considering the interrelationship between language, meaning, and society. These developments have broadened the scope of Discourse Analysis (DA onwards) beyond the interpretation and discussion of meaning-making to the ideology critique and the meaning system and discourse network. Because of this expansion, the field of Discourse Analysis has become interdisciplinary and no more a property of linguistics (Fairclough, 2020; Rubio, 2020).

Developments in the Discourse Studies

Chouliaraki and Fairclough (2022) emphasize that discourse analysis was conducted using mono-modal approaches based on linguistic or visual analysis to interpret the genre texts. However, a multimodal approach has recently emerged that is complementary in nature as it sees how different

"semiosis" (modes) affect meaning when they interact with each other in multimodal texts such as films, museums, displays, and computational texts. In a historic survey of discourse analysis from spoken discourse to multimodal analysis, Lwin (2022) proposed that DA originated from Sociolinguistics and focused only on language use above the sentence and remained confined to talk (spoken discourse). Then under the banner of text grammar, it took up cohesion in written texts as its focus. In another development, it made social critique its main concern under Critical Linguistics. Halliday's Systemic Functional Grammar (SFG) was used as a toolkit for this critique. Before Halliday, sentence-level rules were extended to analyze only texts, but after his notion of language as social semiotics, the analysis framework was also changed. In a further development, text features were related to its social and institutional contexts and the associated politics, ideologies, and world views. This development led to Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA onwards). Halliday provided methods of relating texts with ideologies in his "Discourse Semantics" framework (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2013, p. 35).

Chen (2010) encompasses Fairclough's work as a breakthrough in the history of discourse analysis, emphasizing a synthesis of Halliday's DA, French Philosophy, and Russian Literary Analysis. Lemke related DA with Communication Theories and the work of van Leeuwan, Hodge, Kress, and O' Tool (Sydney Semiotics Circle). In 2005, Leeuwan related DA to semiosis other than language (visual, audial, and spatial). These works may be regarded as early attempts to introduce Multimodal Discourse Analysis, which has established now as a field of research within the umbrella of discourse analysis (Gu & Catalano, 2022; O'Halloran, 2022; Smith & Sheyholislami, 2022). With the advent of multimodal discourse analysis, "the traditional divisions between language-oriented analyses, Saussure's semiology, and sign system-oriented semiotics" disappeared.

Presently, in the field of DA, two analytical approaches dominate: one is a critical framework originating mainly from the work of Fairclough, and the other is a multimodal framework originating from the Sydney Circle (Fie, 2004). Fie (2004) considers that the multi-semiotic developments in film, TV, computer, and the internet hugely contributed to multimodality. Ning (2022) draws attention to the fact that the weakening of the cultural, political, and economic boundaries under globalization led to the weakening of semiotic boundaries. Some discourse researchers attached these developments to post-modernity (e.g., Calhoun et al., 2022; Li, 2016).

Conceptual Framework of Multimodality

 Ledin and Machin (2020) endorse Fie (2004), who opines that "we live in a multimodal society which makes meaning through the co-deployment of a combination of semiotic resources" (p.220). Barton (2009) also supports the same view when he says that "we live in a textually mediated social world where texts are the part of the glue of social life" (p.38). For him, understanding contemporary life only by understanding texts is problematic (see Krippendorf, 2020, for more on it).

Multimodality may refer to using more than one mode or semiotic system in the same text context in an integrated or complementary manner. Fie (2004) employs the term "intra-semiosis" for this co-occurrence. However, it is also used for the transition of the exact text from one mode to another in different contexts, which is called "re-semiotization" (Iedema, 2003, p.41) or "inter semiosis" (Fie, 2004, p.221) or reconstruction of reality", "semantic reconstruals" (O'Halloran, 2022, p. 23). Now the question arises of why texts should be multimodal or multi-semiotic. Iedema (2003) remarks that multimodality provides means to describe a practice or representation in all its semiotic complexity and richness. Notably, a multimodal account does not a priori privilege any semiotic over the other, although the practice itself may foreground one particular one. The foregrounding of one is often accompanied (or achieved) by the backgrounding or "automatization" (Halliday, 1982, p.45) of other semiotic to the point where they appear so normal and natural as to become invisible (pp.39-40).

Slembrouck (2009) and Harder (2009) substantiated Iedema (2003) and asserted that verbal mode foregrounds the others because of a particular place of human language and the traditional dichotomy of channels as speech or writing, too, reinforces the same conception. Kress (2004) and Iedema (2003) insinuate that from an occasional interest in other semiotic modes, this foregrounding turns to a norm where all texts are seen as multimodal and are described in that way. Language is likely to be part of these semiotic objects, though it might not and often it might not be the dominant or most significant mode. Zhao (2010) calls the study of resemiotization a significant development in Modal Discourse Analysis (MDA). This discussion shows that multimodality may refer to the exact text as multimodal, a combination of modes or transition of the text from one mode to the other in different contexts. The last usage, resemiotization by Iedema (2003), needs some illustration.

Iedema (2003), based on his studies (1997, 2000, 2001), has operationalized resemiotization of texts through applications from the fields of education, technological gadgets, and architecture. He explains how one semiotic shift to another in chronically related sequenced transitions. These transitions are not reversible; each transition leads to a reconstruction of reality, reorganization of "social space," or "re-materialization" (p. 547). Bazerman and Kress (2008) used the term "transformation" to refer to changes in representation within the same mode and "transduction" to refer to changes across the modes (p. 169). Transduction, reconstruction, or re-materialization involves new semiosis (linguistic, non-linguistic), new meanings, new importance, and new resources and gradually "divorces" the text from its original context. Iedema thinks that the meaning-making process involves inter-semiotic shifts, and understanding a text in its final representation requires understanding its whole semiotic history. He explains this process with an example of the plan of a health facility. The plan was first discussed face to face in a meeting (spoken semiosis). It became an executive summary and was approved (written semiosis (s) and finally resemiotized as architectural design (non-linguistic semiosis).

Ledin and Machin (2020) and Iedema (2003) responded, based on their reviews of studies, that each semiotic (roughly mode) has its constraints, and to overcome them, shifts to other semiosis become necessary. What language can do, pictures cannot do, and vice versa. Nevertheless, resemiotization can take place if each semiotic can provide "unproblematic, transparent, and direct translation for the meanings made in another semiotic" (pp.47-48) and acknowledges that such "semiotic equations" are always tricky. Semiosis, however, may be set to have the "division of labours" ability to complement each other in the meaning-making process (p.48). This discussion leads to the conclusion that texts are not mono-modal in nature, so more than simple linguistic analysis is needed. For a balanced understanding, a shift towards multimodal discourse analysis seems invertible.

Chen (2010) yields Halliday the credit for redefining the philosophic notion of modality (context-independent truth of assertion) as social modality-- a social, interpersonal, and shared truth in his meta-functional theory of language (see Webster's edited collections of Halliday, 2003). Based on Halliday and Hasan, Unsworth (2008, pp.1-27) points out that Halliday's theory has enabled social semiotics to see "culture as totality of all meaning-making modes". Chen (2010) introduced this notion of social modality in a study of multimodal textbooks taught at primary and secondary levels in China and concluded that multimodal analysis could

enable the analyst to identify the modality (social truth) conveyed through textbooks as absolute or shared.

Issues with Multimodal Discourse Analysis

Zhao (2010) traces the origin of multimodal discourse analysis (MDA onwards) in the classic works of Kress and Leeuwen (1996, 2006) and O' Toole (1994). Further, he finds its theoretical underpinning in Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL onwards) (also O' Halloran, 2022; Fie, 2010). Before the discussion is turned to the framework of analysis, some essential issues encountered by MDA need particular attention. Zhao (2010) noted that for SFL use in MDA, a reconceptualization of *rank* was necessary. Maagero et al. (2021) illustrate that the rank/constituency model (morpheme, word, phrase, clause) takes texts as a product of clauses. In contrast, the multimodal text is not just the total of smaller units of text and images; instead, "it is a meaning-making process in which choice from one semiotic system is constantly coupling with or developing from the choice made in another system" (p. 25). This concept of the text is the first step in MDA.

There is also an issue at the methodological level. Ontologically, language and other semiosis represent reality differently. Besides, when multimodal texts are analyzed, language-based metalanguage is used. This results in the meaninglessness of preference for one semiosis over the other because language cannot be avoided. So, the biggest challenge MDA practitioners face is the metalanguage that can capture the dynamic nature of multimodal discourse and human semiosis (roughly communication) in general (Zhao, 2010; Fie, 2004).

Gee (2014) argues that discourse analysis involves asking and answering questions. These questions are the toolkit for analysis, emphasizing at the same time the need for social validity for this analysis (validity across researchers). Gee says that this discourse is primarily communication, and humans can communicate via language, other sign systems, or both. So, the analytical method suggested by him for linguistic discourse analysis can be adopted for multimodal analysis.

Visual Grammar in Multimodal Discourse Analysis

Fie (2004) suggested that to cover both text and hypertext MDA, an interdisciplinary approach should be followed based on linguistics, visual communication studies, and media studies. This model is a meta-model that integrates SFL with other models and is called Integrative Multi-Semiotic Model (IMM) (for detail see O' Halloran, 2008). This model

applies to two semiotic resources, language and visual images. Each semiotic system has three levels/planes, which are mediated by the medium and materiality of the text, expression, content, and context. *The expression* level consists of typography, language choices, and graphic choices for images. *The content* plane consists of lexico-grammar and discourse semantics for language and visual grammar for images; the *context* plane consists of register, genre, and ideology for both language and image. Here, the semiotic interface takes place. This integration results in the expansion of meaning or using Lemke's (1998) term "multiplication of meaning" or Royce et al.'s (2007) term "inter-semiotic complementarity" or Fie's (2004) term "inter-semiosis" or Kress's (2004) term "transduction".

Further, O' Halloran (2004) explains that this integration simultaneously expands meaning at all three planes. However, he admits that fully understanding what and how this expansion in meaning-making is still possible. This problem arises out of two possibilities "co-contextualization", when there is a convergence between the semiotic system, and "re-contextualization," if there is divergence. (For concrete examples of the application of this interdisciplinary approach (see Krippendorff & Halabi, 2020).

Van Leeuwen (2005) contributed to MDA methodology by suggesting four ways to identify cohesion in multimodal text and communicative events:

- *Rhythm***:** It refers to a composition in time that provides cohesion in conversations, oral story, telling, music, acting, dance, film, and television.
- *Layout:* It refers to *a* composition in space that provides cohesion in pages, screens, paintings, museum exhibits, and building sites. (here, composition means the arrangement of elements).
- *Information linking* is verbal linking (explicit or implicit) provided through conjunctions. There is visual and verbal-visual linking (found in non-linear multimodal texts (that can be linked in any order). In the latter case, linking is provided through *elaboration*--- when the same information is added to the previous by different modes and mediums and through *extensions* ---when new information is added to the previous by different modes and mediums.
- *Dialogue* refers to the cohesion provided through exchange structures (adjacency pairs). They are sequential, and sequences (turns or moves) can be multimodal and simultaneous. However,

such sequencing is prominent in spoken discourse and simultaneously in music.

Multimodal Analysis in English Teaching

These models are essential as they show a path to future researchers, but such models only go beyond the composition of multimodal texts. There was still a need to devise models for step-by-step analysis both for research and teaching, which was fulfilled adequately by the analytic models of Baldry and Thibault (2010). They have presented methods of transcription and analysis of print pages, web pages, and films. Another mentionable model, which specifically meets the needs of stylistic analysis, was proposed by Norgaard (2019). Norgaard has grounded her work in Halliday's social semiotic theory of language that encompasses all meaning-bearing modes, including language. The theory says that a clause conveys three meanings simultaneously: experiential or ideational, interpersonal, and textual. As a result, the analysis of longer texts, literary/non-literary, became possible. She credited Kress and Leeuwen (1996, 2006) for extending this approach to multi-semiotic discourse analysis. The authors suggest visual communication occurs between "represented participants" and "interactive participants" through images. For them, images have their grammar and syntax. Norgaard (2018) suggested a toolkit for the stylistic analysis of novels by exploiting these semiotic and multimodal perspectives.

However, Norgaard's (2018) toolkit can be used as a step-by-step method of teaching multiliteracies and multimodal or, more broadly, multi-semiotic texts, and even researching all dimensions of meaning involved in a multimodal or single modal text. This framework can be adopted in Pakistani classrooms as its components do not demand learning of different teaching skills, except a change in outlook about the textual meaning. She has divided the toolkit into different modes, including wording, visuals (photography and drawing), typography (handwriting, calligraphy, printing, and color), layout (informational structure, salience, and framing), and materiality (cover, paper, and binding). Researchers can combine Rose's (2016) method of researching visual materials with Norgaard's analytic framework for all strands of discourse analysis, including critical discourse analysis.

Ravelli (2019) utilized Royce's (1998) model to suggest pedagogical strategies for image analysis in university classes. The researcher made this choice because Royce's model related meta-functions of language with visual and verbal meanings of the text for critical multimodal analysis of

texts. This model contained almost all the details proposed by Norgaard for multimodal stylistic analysis of literary texts. Ravelli (2019) has proposed the following strategies:

> ***Stage 1***: Observe and describe (students look, respond, and discuss)

> ***Stage2***: Technicalize: (students identify core parts of the visual grammar)

> ***Stage3:*** Technicalize again (students identify more delicate options in visual grammar)

> ***Stage 4***: Focus on foregrounded patterns: (students relate visual grammar analysis to the whole text and other texts).

Review of Research on Discourse-Based English Teaching

The following review of previous studies, mostly related to the pivotal models and studies, helped construct the discourse-based English teaching strategies. The areas covered included evaluation of multimodal contents of textbooks, traditional and digital text analyses, disciplinary limitations, assessment of multimodal analysis of texts, teachers' competence and skills for multimodal language pedagogy, and learning resources for discourse-based English teaching.

Chen (2010) used multimodal analysis for truth judgments about the primary and secondary textbooks of English teaching in China. Jamani (2011) provided a four-level framework for multimodal analysis of scientific discourse in classrooms of two physics teachers. The framework based on the social semiotic views of Halliday, Lemke, and Jamani was employed to compare two pedagogical approaches. These pedagogical approaches are expository (verbal) and multimodal**.** Norgaard (2018) claimed that though the field is still very young, it helps analyze multimodal literary texts like novels and dramas. It is being applied by multimodal stylisticians, however, with some problems, such as applying the apparatus of verbal language to visual semiotic resources.

Similarly, besides verbal mode, the grammar of visual images, layout, and typography are involved simultaneously. It shows that standard multimodal grammar needs to be improved.

Another critical issue is that academicians must be more expert in using all semiotic modes. However, Norgraard (2017, 2018) suggests that, initially, teachers and researchers can work with one or two modes, or the cooperation of experts in other modes can temporarily solve this problem.

Jewitt & Jones (2008, pp.159-160) point out that the multimodal approach is laborious and time-consuming, yet it provides teachers/researchers with "powerful analytical tools" to explore, even taboos. Kell (2009) says that the work in the field of multimodality does not yet have any adequate theorization of practices" (p.79).

Astroga (2009) reviewed studies of specialists in literacy education. He thinks that if students are to become an effective participants in emerging multiliteracies. They need to understand how language, image, and digital rhetoric resources can be deployed independently and interactively to construct different kinds of meaning (also see Jones et al., 2015, pp.1-17). Archer (2006) argues that the visual/verbal distinction should abolished, and a multimodal approach to academic literacy in fields like Engineering should be adopted to understand the relationship between technologies and society. His observations are based on a study of return reports and visual posters submitted by his Engineering students for a communication course.

Further, Archer (2006) suggested that, like multimodal pedagogy, multimodal assessment practices should be promoted as the researcher himself successfully followed them in the students' assessment. However, he pointed out that multimodality has limited access to word-based fields like Humanities. So, Archer stresses that he does not advocate replacing existing literacy practices with multimodality but rather extending them to deal with the text and present "culture capitals" (knowledge) in different modes. Another observation of his is that "although all modes can realize all functions, they are pushed in certain directions by particular text and practices" such as feelings can be expressed better in visual mode than the verbal mode.

Jewitt (2008) agrees with Archer that it is wrong to ask, "what is best?" Instead, it should be "what is best for what purpose?" (p.327). She says reading and writing are multimodal, but print-based literacy still dominates education and disconnects school literacy from out-of-school worlds. Bazerman and Kress (2008) analyzed multimodal digital and print resources for secondary school English, Science, and Mathematics in England, used in 1930 and 2005. The comparison was made by selecting a persistent topic such as simile from English, digestion from Science, and angles from Mathematics. The authors concluded that the movement of meaning material from mode to mode resulted in re-contextualization that, in turn, was indicated by the participants' selection, arrangement, foregrounding, and social relations. Further, they also noted a decrease in domination of writing in textbooks.

Dimpoulos (2001) has discussed studies that applied a post-modernist perspective to multimodal pedagogy and related it with the cultural context of the educational institute (emphasized in SFL-MDA. Please see Victor, 2011), which is materialized by buildings, furniture, decorations, equipment, and wall displays. As noted earlier, multimodality is thought to have a post-modernist trajectory, and only if the material culture of the educational institute matches with post-modernity can multimodal pedagogy be practiced in language classrooms.

Guijarro and Sanz (2009) proposed a method for analyzing children's picture books based on Halliday, Nikolajera and Scott (2000,2001). These analysts adopted this model because they think that Kress and Leeuwen's model (2005) analyzes verbal and visual modes independently without considering their interplay. The model they have proposed consists of the following categories for analysis:

- *Symmetrical interaction*--- exits when words and images convey "the same story, repeating information through different forms of communication".
- *Ideational complementarity*---exists if words and images represent different meanings but complement each other.
- *Counterpointing interplay*--- exists if words and images provide alternative information and "collaborate to communicate meanings beyond the scope of either one standing alone."
- *Contradictory interaction*--- exists if words and pictures represent entirely different.

Mathewman, Blight, and Davis (2004) and Unsworth (2008) argue that the use of multimodal pedagogy has now been established in academic circles, and English is "the prime site for innovation and development" (p.153). They say that the question faced by the practitioners has been how to respond to emerging "text form association with information and multimedia technologies". The researchers have found a response to this question in the New London Group's Model. This project was designed to investigate the impact of multimodal pedagogy on different subject areas, including English. The pedagogic model used in the case study as part of the project considered four steps:

- *Situated practice*--- using design of meaning (modes) available at the workplaces.
- *Overt instruction*--- direct teaching of modes with relevant meta language.
- *Critical framing*--- thinking about social and cultural contexts associated with the modes.

- ***Transformed practice***--- the current mono-modal / practices are transformed into multimodal ones.

The researchers, however, have pointed out some hurdles in applying the New London Group's Model. First, the modes (designs of the meaning) are only involved in some situations, and a standard metalanguage for teachers and students is another issue. Then expertise in ICT is a prerequisite for such pedagogy. However, they suggest that to solve the problem of metalanguage, familiar categories can be taken from media studies and A-level courses. They conclude that "one might say the following with some confidence. Language-as-speech will remain the major mode of communication; language-as-writing will increasingly be replaced by the image in many domains of public communication, though writing will remain the preferred mode of the political and cultural elites" (Mathewman, Blight, & Davis, 2004, p.172).

Potential Strategies for Discourse-Based English Teaching in Pakistan

Drawing upon the theoretical perspective developed from the review of selected studies, implications for English teaching in Pakistan are being discussed now. First, as the field is yet nascent, teacher educators and universities should conduct classroom-based research to explore multimodality applications. Second, multimodal discourse-based pedagogy must be integrated into curriculum and teacher education. The work by Love (2008) and her colleagues at Melbourne University, Australia, can be an initiation. She has designed programs for teacher training in multimodal pedagogy. For a practical model, LASS (Literacy Across the School Subjects) DVD and BUILT (Building Understandings in Literacy and Teaching) CD ROM can be studied and trialed in Pakistan. This material has already been used in Australia, the UK, Indonesia, Denmark, and the UAE. (http://extranet.edfac.unimelb.edu.au?LLAE /LASS/lass.html). This active service encompasses digital literacy, standard written genres, multi-genre texts, oral language, and even science subjects (accessed on 3 January 2023).

The policymakers in Pakistan can also get insights from the experiences of those Asian countries which have introduced multimodal and multi-literacy/discipline-specific courses in their English teaching (e.g., Singapore's [2010] initiative was critically explored in Lin, Chia, & Nguyen, 2022). As the world is moving towards digitization of communication and English teaching is not immune to its effects, Pakistani teachers can exploit the use of social media applications by students of all

levels. Instagram, YouTube, Google Sites, Story-bird, Youth Voice, BBC Learning English, and Learn English Podcasts can be utilized for critical media literacy learning (CMLL) (Afrilyasanti, Basthomi, & Zen, 2022). However, the selection of materials for discourse-based teaching is of paramount importance. It will have to be assessed and adapted to Pakistan's cultural and practical context, for which proper guidelines may be taken from research (e.g., Haung, 2019). Martens, Balling, and Higgason (2022) offer an exciting and practical proposal for exploiting university students' interest in TikTok. The authors have suggested how reading can be a fun by relating students, books, and technology using # BookTokMadeMeReadIT.

[This whole section deals with the real issues whose solution is being explored in this paper].

Conclusion

In ELT, CLT (Communicative Language Teaching) needs to be more emphasized with understanding its preconditions for a country like Pakistan. It requires communicative slabs to develop discourse competence, which includes production and comprehension of discourse in real world encounters. For a discourse based English teaching, prospective teachers should have a thorough grounding in discourse analysis, pragmatics, and sociolinguistics. However, this is a postmodern world with multimodal texts, so multimodal literacies are the need of the hour. For this to happen, multimodal discourse analysis and multimodal pedagogy are inevitable. Before it comes to classrooms, such pedagogy needs a genre-based syllabus, digital classrooms, tech-savvy teachers, and multimodal learning materials such as drama, soap operas, and talk shows, simulated or recorded.

To implement these strategies in Pakistan, reconceptualization of communicative teaching is essential. It includes revisiting the syllabus, teaching materials, textual analysis, and effective interactive delivery in classrooms. Besides, to understand different pedagogical, curricular, and policy dimensions, more extensive and systematic review is recommended that should be followed by field-based collaborative case studies involving discourse analysts and English teachers from all tiers. Despite these limitations, the main contribution of this reflective paper is providing an adequate template of an alternative approach to English teaching in Pakistan that is needed to cope with communicative challenges in a post-modernist world.

[This, too, is all about Pakistan].

References

Afrilyasanti, R., Basthomi, Y., & Zen, E. L. (2022). Turning up a CMLL Toolbox: Analyzing Web-Based Applications for Critical Media Literacy Learning. Interactive. *Technology and Smart Education*. (19(4). pp. 544-567. Doi: 10.1108/TTSE-07-2022-0088.

Archer, A. (2006). Multimodal Approaches to Academic Literacies: Problematizing the Visual/Verbal Divide. *Language and Education, 20* (6). Doi: 10.2167/le677.0

Astorga, M. C. (2009). The Text-Image Matching: One Story, Two Textualizations. In E. Vertola & Guijaro (Eds.), *The World Told and The World Shown: Multi-Semiotic Issues* (pp. 124-138). Palgrave-MacMillan.

Baldry, A. & Thibault, P. J. (2010). *Multimodal Transcription and Text Analysis: A Multimedia Toolkit and Course-book.* London: Equinox.

Barton, D. (2009). Understanding Textual Practices in Changing World. In M. Baynham & M. Prinslod (Eds.), *The Future of Literacy Studies.* (pp. 38-53). Palgrave-MacMillan.

Bazerman, J, & Kress, G. (2008). Writing in Multimodal Texts: A social Semiotic Account of Designs for Learning. *Western Communication, 25* (2). pp. 166-195). Doi: 101177/074/1088.30

Borba, M. C., O'Halloran, K. L., & Neves, L. X. (2022). Multimodality, Systemic Functional-Multimodal Discourse Analysis and Production of Videos in Mathematics Education. In *Handbook of Cognitive Mathematics* (pp. 909-938). Cham: Springer International Publishing.

Calhoun, C., Gerteis, J., Moody, J., Pfaff, S., & Virk, I. (Eds.). (2022). *Contemporary sociological theory*. John Wiley & Sons.

Chen, Y. (2010). Contestable Reality: A Multimodal View in Multimodal Pedagogic Context. In A. Mahboob, & N.K. Knight (Eds.), *Appliable Linguistics*. (pp. 221-233). Continuum.

Chouliaraki, L., & Fairclough, N. (2022). Discourse in late modernity. In *Discourse in Late Modernity*. Edinburgh University Press.

Dimopoulos, K. (2011). Signifying the Transition from Modern to Post-Modern Schooling through Analyzing Changes in the Material Cultures of Schools. In S. C. Hamel (Ed.), *Semiotics: Theory and Applications*. (pp. 1-35). NY: NOVA

Fairclough, N. (2020). Language and Discourse. In *Language in Use* (pp. 234-241). Routledge.

Fie, V. L. (2004). Developing an Integrative Multisemiotic Model. In K. L. O'Halloran (Ed.), *Multimodal Discourse Analysis: Systemic Functional Perspectives.* (pp. 220-246). Continuum.

Gee, J. P. (2014). *How to Do Discourse Analysis? A Toolkit*. Routledge.

Gee, J. P. (2018). *Introducing Discourse Analysis: From Grammar to Society*. Routledge.

Gu, X., & Catalano, T. (2022). Representing transition experiences: A multimodal critical discourse analysis of young immigrants in children's literature. *Linguistics and Education*, *71*, 101083.

Guijarro, A. J. M., & Sanz, M. J. P. (2009). On Interaction of Image and Verbal Text in a Picture Book: A Multimodal and Systemic Functional Study. In E. Ventola & A.J.M. Guijarro (Eds.), *The World Told and the World Shown: Multisemiotic Issues* (pp. 107-123). Palgrave-MacMillan.

Halliday, M. A. K., & Matthiessen, C. M. (2013). *Halliday's introduction to functional grammar*. Routledge.

Harder, P. (2009). Communication. In J. Verschueren & J. Ostman (Eds.), *Key Notions for Pragmatics.* (pp. 62-85). Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Co.

Haung, Shin-Ying. (2018). A Critical Multimodal Framework for Reading and Analyzing Pedagogical Materials. *English Teaching: Practice & Critique*. 18(1). pp. 52-69. Doi: 10.1108/ETTPC-08-2018-0078.

Iedema, R. (2003). Multimodality, Resemiotization, Practice: Extending the Analysis of Discourse as Multisemiotic. *Visual Communication*, 2 (29). Pp. 29-57. Doi: 10.1177/14700357203002001751

Jamani, K. J. (2011). A Semiotic Discourse Analysis Framework: Understanding Meaning Making in Science Education Contexts. In S. C. Hamel (Ed.), *Semiotics: Theory and Application*s. (pp. 191-208). NY: NOVA

Jaworski, A. (2020). Multimodal writing: The avant-garde assemblage and other minimal texts. *International Journal of Multilingualism*, *17*(3), 336-360.

Jewitt, C. & Jones, K. (2008). Multimodal Discourse Analysis: The Case of 'Ability' in UK Secondary School English. In V. K. Bhattia, J. Flowerdew, & R. H. Jones (Eds*.), Advances in Discourse Studies.* (pp. 149-160). Routledge.

Jones, R. H., Chik, A. & Hafner, C. A. (2015). (Eds.). *Discourse and Digital Practices: Doing Discourse Analysis in the Digital Age.* Routledge.

Kell, C. (2009). Literacy Practices, Text (s) and Meaning Making Process Across Time and Space. In M. Baynham & M. Prinslod (Eds.), *The Future of Literacy Studies*. (pp. 75-99). Palgrave-MacMillan.

Kress, G., & Van Leeuwen, T. (2020). *Reading images: The grammar of visual design*. Routledge.

Kress, G. (2004). Reading Images: Multimodality, Representation and New Media. *Information Design*, 12 (2). pp. 110-119. Retrieved from

Krippendorff, K. & Halabi, N. (2020). (Eds.). *Discourses in Action: What Language Enables us to Do?* Routledge.

Lemke, J. L. (1998). Teaching all the languages of Science: Words, symbols, images, and actions. In *Conference on science education in Barcelona*.

Li, Y. (2016). Cross-political pan-commercialism in the postmodern age and proposed readjustment of semiotic practices. *Semiotica*, *2016*(213), 365-396.

Lin, F. V., Chia, A. & Nguyen, T.T.H. (2022). "From the Beginning I think it was a Stretch"-Teachers' Perceptions and Practices in teaching Multiliteracies. *English Teaching Practice & Critique* (21(4), pp. 379-396. Doi: 10.1108/ETPC-01-2021-0025.

Love, K. (2008). Literacy Across the School Subjects: A Multimodal Approach. In L. Unsworth (Ed.), *Multimodal Semiotics: Analysis in Context of Education*. (pp. 171-186). Continuum.

Lwin, S. M. (2022). Discourse analysis. In *Research Anthology on Applied Linguistics and Language Practices* (pp. 1573-1595). IGI Global.

Maagerø, E., Mulvad, R., & Tønnessen, E. S. (2021). *Women in Social Semiotics and SFL: Making a Difference*. Routledge.

Martens, M., Balling, G., & Higgason, K. A. (2022). #BookTokMadeMeReadIT: Young Adult Reading Communities Across an International Socio-technical Landscape. *Information and Learning Sciences*. 123 (11/12). pp. 705-722. Doi: 10.1108/ILS-07-2022-0086.

Mathewman, S. Blight, A., Davies, C. (2004). What does Multimodal Means for English? Creative Tensions in Teaching New Texts and New Literacies. *Education, Communication & Information.* pp. 153-176. Doi: 10.1080/1463631042000210944

Ning, W. (2022). *After Postmodernism*. Taylor & Francis.

Norgaard, N. ((2019*). Multimodal Stylistics of the Novel: More than Words*. Routledge.

Nørgaard, N. (2017). Multimodality and stylistics. In *The Routledge handbook of stylistics* (pp. 489-502). Routledge.

Nørgaard, N. (2018). *Multimodal stylistics of the novel: More than words*. Routledge.

O'Halloran, K. L. (2004). Introduction, In K.L. Halloran (Ed.), *Multimodal Discourse Analysis: Systemic Functional Perspectives*. (pp. 1-10). Continuum.

O'Halloran, K. (2022). Critical discourse analysis and language cognition. In *Critical Discourse Analysis and Language Cognition*. Edinburgh University Press.

Ravelli, L. (2019). Pedagogical Strategies for Developing Interpretive Language about Images: A Tertiary Experience. *English Teaching: Practice & Critique*. 18(1). Pp. 11-118. Doi: 10.1108/ETTC-12-2017-0173.

Rose, G. (2016). *Visual Methodologies: An Introduction to Researching with Visual Materials* (4th ed.). SAGE.

Royce, T. D., Royce, T. D., & Bowcher, W. L. (2007). Intersemiotic complementarity: a framework for multimodal. *New directions in the analysis of multimodal discourse*, 63-109.

Rubio, J. (2022). Educational language policy in massachusetts: Discourses of the look act. *Educational Policy*, *36*(6), 1440-1463.

Slembrouck. S. (2009). Channel. In Verschueren & J. Ostman (Eds.), *Key Notions for Pragmatics.* (pp. 48-61). Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Co.

Smith, C., & Sheyholislami, J. (2022). Current Trends in Critical Discourse Studies of Textbooks: A Look at Selected Literature. *Canadian Journal of Applied Linguistics/Revue canadienne de linguistique appliquée*, *25*(1), 47-63.

Stonecipher, R. (2020). Divergent Approaches to Discourse Analysis. In K. Krippendorff, & N. Halabi (Eds.), *Discourses in Action: What Language Enables us to Do?* Routledge.

Unsworth, L. (2008). Multimodal Semiotic Analysis and Education. In L. Unsworth (Ed.), *Multimodal Semiotics: Analysis in Contexts of Education*. (pp. 1-14). Continuum.

Van Leeuwen, T. (2005). *Introducing Social Semiotics*. Routledge.

Victor, L. F. (2011*). A Systemic Functional Multimodal Discourse Analysis Approach to Pedagogic Discourse* [Doctoral Thesis]. National University of Singapore.

Webster, J. (2003). (Ed.). *On Language and Linguistics [MAK. Halliday].* Continuum.
www. knowledgerepresentation.org/building the future/…/Kress.html.

Zhao, S. (2010). Rank in Visual Grammar: Some Implications for Multimodal Discourse Analysis. In A. Mahboob & NK. Knight (Eds.*). Appliable Linguistics*. (pp. 251-266). Continuum.

Manuscript Submission Guidelines:

Authors Guidelines

- **Title:** The title of the article should be bold, centered, and typed in capital letters (in 14 points) in Times New Roman Font.
- **Author(s) Details:** Author(s) details including full name (bold), affiliations, and contact details should be in (12 points) Times New Roman Font and should be centered below the title.
- **Abstract:** All manuscripts must be accompanied by a brief abstract. The abstract should not exceed 150-200 words. It should be properly formatted as justified in italicized text in Times New Roman Font (10 points). It should highlight the Research Background, Methodology, Major Finding(s), and Conclusion in brief.
- **Key Words:** Authors must mention 5-7 keywords. Keywords should be listed alphabetically, separated by commas, and full stops at the end.
- **Page Setup:** The size of the page should have 7 inches Width and 9.5 inches Height with 1- 1-inch margin on all four sides. The header and Footer Layout should be 0.5 inches from the edge.
- **Manuscript:** Manuscripts must in between 4000 – 6000 words (all inclusive). It should be 1.0 line spaced, in Times New Roman font 12 point.
- **Tables and Figures/Images:** All important tables and figures/images should be incorporated into the body of the paper. The heading of the Table should be in Times New Roman, Bold, 12 Points, and 0.25 inches indent (Left). Heading of the Figure/Images Should also be of the same specifications as Tables but below the Image/Figure and Centrally Aligned.
- **References:** All references should be listed alphabetically at the end of the article using APA reference style only.
- **Citations in the Text:** Kindly make sure that every reference cited in the text should also be presented in the reference list and vice versa. Authors should avoid using citations in the abstract of the manuscript.
- **Author(s) Biography:** Every author must submit a brief biography, and a photograph along with the Copyright Agreement form. Footnotes should be numbered consecutively.
- All manuscripts must be submitted electronically at the journal's website:
  http://ojs.ucp.edu.pk/index.php/ucpjll/about/submissions .